THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY OF PENNSYLVANIA

HOUSE BILL

No. 999

Session of 2021

INTRODUCED BY RABB, RYAN AND PENNYCUICK, APRIL 1, 2021

REFERRED TO COMMITTEE ON JUDICIARY, APRIL 1, 2021

AN ACT

Amending Titles 18 (Crimes and Offenses) and 42 (Judiciary and Judicial Procedure) of the Pennsylvania Consolidated 2 Statutes, in authorized disposition of offenders, further 3 providing for sentence for murder, murder of unborn child and 4 murder of law enforcement officer; in arson, criminal 5 mischief and other property destruction, further providing 6 for the offense of arson and related offenses; and, in 7 sentencing, further providing for sentencing procedure for 8 murder of the first degree. 10 The General Assembly of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania 11 hereby enacts as follows: 12 Section 1. Sections 1102(a) and 3301(b)(1) of Title 18 of 13 the Pennsylvania Consolidated Statutes are amended to read: 14 § 1102. Sentence for murder, murder of unborn child and murder 15 of law enforcement officer. 16 (a) First degree. --17 Except as provided under section 1102.1 (relating to 18 sentence of persons under the age of 18 for murder, murder of 19 an unborn child and murder of a law enforcement officer), a 20 person who has been convicted of a murder of the first degree or of murder of a law enforcement officer of the first degree 21 22 shall be sentenced to [death or to] a term of life

- imprisonment in accordance with 42 Pa.C.S. § 9711 (relating
- 2 to sentencing procedure for murder of the first degree).
- 3 (2) The sentence for a person who has been convicted of
- 4 first degree murder of an unborn child shall be the same as
- 5 the sentence for murder of the first degree.[, except that
- the death penalty shall not be imposed. This paragraph shall
- 7 not affect the determination of an aggravating circumstance
- 8 under 42 Pa.C.S. § 9711(d)(17) for the killing of a pregnant
- 9 woman.]
- 10 * * *
- 11 § 3301. Arson and related offenses.
- 12 * * *
- 13 (b) Sentence.--
- 14 (1) A person convicted of violating the provisions of
- subsection (a) (2), murder of the first degree[,] or second
- 16 <u>degree</u> shall be sentenced to [death or] life imprisonment
- 17 without right to parole[; a person convicted of murder of the
- second degree, pursuant to subsection (a)(2), shall be
- sentenced to life imprisonment without right to parole].
- Notwithstanding provisions to the contrary, no language
- 21 herein shall infringe upon the inherent powers of the
- 22 Governor to commute said sentence.
- 23 * * *
- 24 Section 2. Section 9711 of Title 42 is amended to read:
- 25 § 9711. Sentencing procedure for murder of the first degree.
- [(a) Procedure in jury trials.--
- 27 (1)] After a verdict of murder of the first degree is
- recorded [and before the jury is discharged], the court shall
- 29 [conduct a separate sentencing hearing in which the jury
- 30 shall determine whether the defendant shall be sentenced to

- death or] sentence the defendant to life imprisonment.
- 2 [(2) In the sentencing hearing, evidence concerning the victim and the impact that the death of the victim has had on
- the family of the victim is admissible. Additionally,
- 5 evidence may be presented as to any other matter that the
- 6 court deems relevant and admissible on the question of the
- 7 sentence to be imposed. Evidence shall include matters
- 8 relating to any of the aggravating or mitigating
- 9 circumstances specified in subsections (d) and (e), and
- information concerning the victim and the impact that the
- death of the victim has had on the family of the victim.
- 12 Evidence of aggravating circumstances shall be limited to
- those circumstances specified in subsection (d).
- 14 (3) After the presentation of evidence, the court shall
- permit counsel to present argument for or against the
- sentence of death. The court shall then instruct the jury in
- accordance with subsection (c).
- 18 (4) Failure of the jury to unanimously agree upon a
- sentence shall not impeach or in any way affect the guilty
- verdict previously recorded.
- 21 (b) Procedure in nonjury trials and guilty pleas. -- If the
- 22 defendant has waived a jury trial or pleaded guilty, the
- 23 sentencing proceeding shall be conducted before a jury impaneled
- 24 for that purpose unless waived by the defendant with the consent
- of the Commonwealth, in which case the trial judge shall hear
- 26 the evidence and determine the penalty in the same manner as
- 27 would a jury as provided in subsection (a).
- 28 (c) Instructions to jury.--
- (1) Before the jury retires to consider the sentencing
- verdict, the court shall instruct the jury on the following

matters:

(i) The	e ag	ggra	avat	ting c	ircums	tand	ces s	pecified	in
subsec	tion	(d)	as	to	which	there	is	some	evidence	∋.

- (ii) The mitigating circumstances specified in subsection (e) as to which there is some evidence.
- (iii) Aggravating circumstances must be proved by the Commonwealth beyond a reasonable doubt; mitigating circumstances must be proved by the defendant by a preponderance of the evidence.
- (iv) The verdict must be a sentence of death if the jury unanimously finds at least one aggravating circumstance specified in subsection (d) and no mitigating circumstance or if the jury unanimously finds one or more aggravating circumstances which outweigh any mitigating circumstances. The verdict must be a sentence of life imprisonment in all other cases.
- (v) The court may, in its discretion, discharge the jury if it is of the opinion that further deliberation will not result in a unanimous agreement as to the sentence, in which case the court shall sentence the defendant to life imprisonment.
- (2) The court shall instruct the jury that if it finds at least one aggravating circumstance and at least one mitigating circumstance, it shall consider, in weighing the aggravating and mitigating circumstances, any evidence presented about the victim and about the impact of the murder on the victim's family. The court shall also instruct the jury on any other matter that may be just and proper under the circumstances.
 - (d) Aggravating circumstances. -- Aggravating circumstances

1 shall be limited to the following:

2	(1) The victim was a firefighter, peace officer, public
3	servant concerned in official detention, as defined in 18
4	Pa.C.S. § 5121 (relating to escape), judge of any court in
5	the unified judicial system, the Attorney General of
6	Pennsylvania, a deputy attorney general, district attorney,
7	assistant district attorney, member of the General Assembly,
8	Governor, Lieutenant Governor, Auditor General, State
9	Treasurer, State law enforcement official, local law
10	enforcement official, Federal law enforcement official or
11	person employed to assist or assisting any law enforcement
12	official in the performance of his duties, who was killed in
13	the performance of his duties or as a result of his official
14	position.

- (2) The defendant paid or was paid by another person or had contracted to pay or be paid by another person or had conspired to pay or be paid by another person for the killing of the victim.
- (3) The victim was being held by the defendant for ransom or reward, or as a shield or hostage.
- (4) The death of the victim occurred while defendant was engaged in the hijacking of an aircraft.
- (5) The victim was a prosecution witness to a murder or other felony committed by the defendant and was killed for the purpose of preventing his testimony against the defendant in any grand jury or criminal proceeding involving such offenses.
- 28 (6) The defendant committed a killing while in the perpetration of a felony.
- 30 (7) In the commission of the offense the defendant

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

- knowingly created a grave risk of death to another person in addition to the victim of the offense.
 - (8) The offense was committed by means of torture.
 - (9) The defendant has a significant history of felony convictions involving the use or threat of violence to the person.
- 7 (10) The defendant has been convicted of another Federal 8 or State offense, committed either before or at the time of 9 the offense at issue, for which a sentence of life 10 imprisonment or death was imposable or the defendant was 11 undergoing a sentence of life imprisonment for any reason at 12 the time of the commission of the offense.
 - (11) The defendant has been convicted of another murder committed in any jurisdiction and committed either before or at the time of the offense at issue.
 - (12) The defendant has been convicted of voluntary manslaughter, as defined in 18 Pa.C.S. § 2503 (relating to voluntary manslaughter), or a substantially equivalent crime in any other jurisdiction, committed either before or at the time of the offense at issue.
- 21 (13) The defendant committed the killing or was an accomplice in the killing, as defined in 18 Pa.C.S. § 306(c) 22 23 (relating to liability for conduct of another; complicity), 24 while in the perpetration of a felony under the provisions of 25 the act of April 14, 1972 (P.L.233, No.64), known as The 26 Controlled Substance, Drug, Device and Cosmetic Act, and punishable under the provisions of 18 Pa.C.S. § 7508 27 (relating to drug trafficking sentencing and penalties). 28
- 29 (14) At the time of the killing, the victim was or had 30 been involved, associated or in competition with the

3

4

5

6

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

defendant in the sale, manufacture, distribution or delivery

of any controlled substance or counterfeit controlled

substance in violation of The Controlled Substance, Drug,

4 Device and Cosmetic Act or similar law of any other state,

the District of Columbia or the United States, and the

defendant committed the killing or was an accomplice to the

killing as defined in 18 Pa.C.S. § 306(c), and the killing

8 resulted from or was related to that association, involvement

9 or competition to promote the defendant's activities in

selling, manufacturing, distributing or delivering controlled

substances or counterfeit controlled substances.

- been a nongovernmental informant or had otherwise provided any investigative, law enforcement or police agency with information concerning criminal activity and the defendant committed the killing or was an accomplice to the killing as defined in 18 Pa.C.S. § 306(c), and the killing was in retaliation for the victim's activities as a nongovernmental informant or in providing information concerning criminal activity to an investigative, law enforcement or police agency.
 - (16) The victim was a child under 12 years of age.
- (17) At the time of the killing, the victim was in her third trimester of pregnancy or the defendant had knowledge of the victim's pregnancy.
- 26 (18) At the time of the killing the defendant was
 27 subject to a court order restricting in any way the
 28 defendant's behavior toward the victim pursuant to 23 Pa.C.S.
 29 Ch. 61 (relating to protection from abuse) or any other order
 30 of a court of common pleas or of the minor judiciary designed

5

7

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

- in whole or in part to protect the victim from the defendant.
- 2 (e) Mitigating circumstances. -- Mitigating circumstances
- 3 shall include the following:

6

7

8

9

10

11

16

- 4 (1) The defendant has no significant history of prior criminal convictions.
 - (2) The defendant was under the influence of extreme mental or emotional disturbance.
 - (3) The capacity of the defendant to appreciate the criminality of his conduct or to conform his conduct to the requirements of law was substantially impaired.
 - (4) The age of the defendant at the time of the crime.
- 12 (5) The defendant acted under extreme duress, although
 13 not such duress as to constitute a defense to prosecution
 14 under 18 Pa.C.S. § 309 (relating to duress), or acted under
 15 the substantial domination of another person.
 - (6) The victim was a participant in the defendant's homicidal conduct or consented to the homicidal acts.
- 18 (7) The defendant's participation in the homicidal act
 19 was relatively minor.
- 20 (8) Any other evidence of mitigation concerning the 21 character and record of the defendant and the circumstances 22 of his offense.
- 23 (f) Sentencing verdict by the jury.--
- 24 (1) After hearing all the evidence and receiving the
 25 instructions from the court, the jury shall deliberate and
 26 render a sentencing verdict. In rendering the verdict, if the
 27 sentence is death, the jury shall set forth in such form as
 28 designated by the court the findings upon which the sentence
 29 is based.
- 30 (2) Based upon these findings, the jury shall set forth

- in writing whether the sentence is death or life
- 2 imprisonment.
- 3 (g) Recording sentencing verdict. -- Whenever the jury shall
- 4 agree upon a sentencing verdict, it shall be received and
- 5 recorded by the court. The court shall thereafter impose upon
- 6 the defendant the sentence fixed by the jury.
- 7 (h) Review of death sentence. --
- (1) A sentence of death shall be subject to automatic
- 9 review by the Supreme Court of Pennsylvania pursuant to its
- 10 rules.
- 11 (2) In addition to its authority to correct errors at
- trial, the Supreme Court shall either affirm the sentence of
- death or vacate the sentence of death and remand for further
- proceedings as provided in paragraph (4).
- 15 (3) The Supreme Court shall affirm the sentence of death
- unless it determines that:
- 17 (i) the sentence of death was the product of
- passion, prejudice or any other arbitrary factor; or
- (ii) the evidence fails to support the finding of at
- least one aggravating circumstance specified in
- subsection (d).
- 22 (4) If the Supreme Court determines that the death
- penalty must be vacated because none of the aggravating
- circumstances are supported by sufficient evidence, then it
- shall remand for the imposition of a life imprisonment
- 26 sentence. If the Supreme Court determines that the death
- penalty must be vacated for any other reason, it shall remand
- for a new sentencing hearing pursuant to subsections (a)
- through (q).
- 30 (i) Record of death sentence to Governor.--Where a sentence

- 1 of death is upheld by the Supreme Court, the prothonotary of the
- 2 Supreme Court shall transmit to the Governor a full and complete
- 3 record of the trial, sentencing hearing, imposition of sentence,
- 4 opinion and order by the Supreme Court within 30 days of one of
- 5 the following, whichever occurs first:
- 6 (1) the expiration of the time period for filing a
- 7 petition for writ of certiorari or extension thereof where
- 8 neither has been filed;
- 9 (2) the denial of a petition for writ of certiorari; or
- 10 (3) the disposition of the appeal by the United States
- 11 Supreme Court, if that court grants the petition for writ of
- 12 certiorari.
- 13 Notice of this transmission shall contemporaneously be provided
- 14 to the Secretary of Corrections.]
- 15 Section 3. This act shall apply to defendants and
- 16 individuals who have not been sentenced as of the effective date
- 17 of this section.
- 18 Section 4. This act shall take effect in 60 days.