THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY OF PENNSYLVANIA

HOUSE BILL

No. 1587 Session of 2019

INTRODUCED BY T. DAVIS, TOOHIL, ROZZI, WARREN, HILL-EVANS, MCNEILL, DONATUCCI, KINSEY, OTTEN, MILLARD, MURT, PICKETT, CALTAGIRONE, NEILSON, READSHAW, DeLUCA, McCLINTON, MARKOSEK, GILLEN, HEFFLEY, FRANKEL, SHUSTERMAN, ZABEL, KORTZ, VITALI, YOUNGBLOOD, DRISCOLL, JOHNSON-HARRELL, BRIGGS, SANCHEZ, THOMAS, BERNSTINE, HENNESSEY, KOSIEROWSKI, ULLMAN, ISAACSON, HOWARD AND GALLOWAY, OCTOBER 15, 2019

REFERRED TO COMMITTEE ON JUDICIARY, OCTOBER 15, 2019

AN ACT

Amending Titles 23 (Domestic Relations) and 42 (Judiciary and Judicial Procedure) of the Pennsylvania Consolidated Statutes, in child custody, further providing for 3 definitions, for award of custody, for factors to consider 4 when awarding custody, for consideration of criminal conviction, for quardian ad litem for child, for counsel for child and for award of counsel fees, costs and expenses; in 7 Administrative Office of Pennsylvania Courts, providing for 8 child abuse and domestic violence education and training 9 program for judges and court personnel; and, in depositions 10 and witnesses, further providing for rights and services. 11 12 The General Assembly of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania 13 hereby enacts as follows: 14 Section 1. The General Assembly finds and declares as 15 follows: 16 (1)The Commonwealth has a duty to protect all children 17 in this Commonwealth and all three branches of the State 18 government play important roles in fulfilling that duty. 19 Domestic violence is a pattern of coercive and controlling tactics by one partner against another in an 20

- intimate partner relationship designed to maintain control over the partner and make the major decisions in the relationship.
 - (3) Although abusers often use physical violence as one of the tactics to commit domestic violence, not all abusers engage in physical violence and most tactics are not physical or illegal.
 - (4) Common tactics used to commit domestic violence include verbal, emotional, psychological and economic abuse, isolation, threats, including threats to seek custody if the victim leaves, controlling behaviors, monitoring, litigation abuse and demands for custody or joint custody to pressure the partner to return or punish the partner for leaving.
 - (5) The health and safety of all children in this Commonwealth must be the first priority in all decisions concerning child custody.
 - (6) In child custody proceedings in which there are allegations of domestic violence, expertise in domestic violence is required to determine if the allegations are valid.
 - (7) It is the intent of the General Assembly to:
 - (i) Ensure that in all cases and controversies before the courts involving questions of child custody, the health, safety and welfare of the child are protected and regarded as issues of paramount importance.
 - (ii) Rectify common past practices in this Commonwealth that have been shown to work poorly for children.
- 29 (iii) Encourage custody court professionals to 30 utilize current and valid scientific research in making

- decisions regarding child custody.
- 2 Section 2. The definition of "abuse" in section 5322(a) of
- 3 Title 23 of the Pennsylvania Consolidated Statutes is amended
- 4 and the subsection is amended by adding definitions to read:
- 5 § 5322. Definitions.
- 6 (a) This chapter. -- The following words and phrases when used
- 7 in this chapter shall have the meanings given to them in this
- 8 subsection unless the context clearly indicates otherwise:
- 9 "Abuse." As follows:
- 10 <u>(1)</u> As defined in section 6102 (relating to definitions)
- 11 [.] and the term includes the following:
- 12 <u>(i) The crime of harassment pursuant to 18 Pa.C.S.</u>
- 13 <u>2709 (relating to harassment).</u>
- 14 (ii) The crime of stalking pursuant to 18 Pa.C.S. §
- 15 2709.1 (relating to stalking).
- 16 (2) The term does not include the justified use of force
- in self-protection or for the protection of other persons in
- accordance with 18 Pa.C.S. Ch. 5 (relating to general
- 19 <u>principles of justification) by a party in response to abuse</u>
- or domestic violence by the other party.
- 21 * * *
- 22 "Health and safety of the child." The term includes, but is
- 23 not limited to, the physical, emotional and psychological
- 24 health, safety and well-being of the child.
- 25 * * *
- 26 "Therapeutic setting." Any setting where a licensed
- 27 therapist, counselor, social worker or other appropriate
- 28 professional quides or monitors the interaction between the
- 29 party and child and ensures the health and safety of the child.
- 30 * * *

- 1 Section 3. Section 5323(e) of Title 23 is amended to read:
- 2 § 5323. Award of custody.
- 3 * * *
- 4 (e) Safety conditions. -- After considering the factors under
- 5 section [5328(a)(2)] $\underline{5328}$, if the court finds that there is an
- 6 ongoing risk of harm to the child or an abused party and awards
- 7 any form of custody to a party who committed the abuse or who
- 8 has a household member who committed the abuse, the court shall
- 9 include in the custody order safety conditions [designed]___
- 10 <u>restrictions or safeguards necessary</u> to protect the child or the
- 11 abused party[.] and to minimize any risk of harm to the child.
- 12 The safety conditions, restrictions or safeguards may include a
- 13 <u>supervised physical custody arrangement imposed on a parent by</u>
- 14 the court. If the court orders a supervised physical custody
- 15 <u>arrangement</u>, the supervised physical custody arrangement shall
- 16 be conducted by a court-approved professional in a therapeutic
- 17 setting and under conditions that ensure the health and safety
- 18 of the child.
- 19 * * *
- Section 4. Section 5328(a) of Title 23 is amended and the
- 21 section is amended by adding a subsection to read:
- 22 § 5328. Factors to consider when awarding custody.
- 23 (a) Factors. -- In ordering any form of custody, the court
- 24 shall determine the best interest of the child by considering
- 25 all relevant factors, giving weighted consideration to those
- 26 factors which affect the health and safety of the child,
- 27 including the following:
- 28 (1) Which party is more likely to ensure the health and
- 29 <u>safety of the child. No form of custody may be awarded to a</u>
- 30 parent or party who jeopardizes the health and safety of the

1	child by unreasonably placing the child at substantial risk
2	of severe emotional distress or bodily injury.

- [(1)] (1.1) Which party is more likely to encourage and permit frequent and continuing contact between the child and another party[.], except in cases of child abuse or domestic violence or if the child's physical or emotional well-being is jeopardized by one of the parties.
- (2) The present and past abuse committed by a party or member of the party's household, whether there is a continued risk of harm to the child or an abused party and which party can better provide adequate physical safeguards and supervision of the child.
- (2.1) The information set forth in section 5329.1(a) (relating to consideration of child abuse and involvement with protective services).
- (2.2) A history of abuse committed by a party or member of the party's household against any of the following:
- 18 <u>(i) The other party.</u>
- 19 (ii) A child in the party's household.
- 20 <u>(iii) Any other party who currently or formerly</u>
 21 resided in the party's household.
- 22 (2.3) A significant history of violent, assaultive or
 23 abusive behavior committed by a party or a member of the
 24 party's household outside of the household or against a
 25 nonfamily member that jeopardizes the health and safety of
 26 the child by unreasonably placing the child at substantial
- 27 <u>risk of severe emotional distress or bodily injury.</u>
- 28 (3) The <u>present and past</u> parental <u>and caretaker</u> duties 29 performed by each party on behalf of the child.
- 30 (4) The need for stability and continuity in the child's

3

4

5

6

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

1 education, family life and community life except if changes 2 are necessary to protect the health and safety of the child. The availability of extended family. 3 (5) The child's sibling relationships. 4 (6) 5 The well-reasoned preference of the child, based on (7) 6 the child's maturity and judgment. <u>In assessing the factor</u> 7 under this paragraph, the child's fear of a parent based on the parent's specific conduct that is contrary to the child's 8 best interest shall be considered well-reasoned. 9 10 The attempts of a parent to turn the child against the other parent as proven by competent and admissible 11 evidence, except in cases of child abuse or domestic violence 12 13 where reasonable safety measures are necessary to protect the 14 child from harm. The following apply: (i) A parent's reasonable concerns for a child's 15 safety and welfare and the parent's reasonable efforts to 16 educate, support and protect the child shall not be 17 18 considered attempts to turn the child against the other 19 parent. 20 (ii) In cases of child abuse and domestic violence, the court shall not use the factor under this paragraph 21 22 in ordering any form of custody. (iii) A child's deficient or negative relationship 23 24 with a parent shall not be presumed to be caused by the 25 other parent. 26 (iv) An order aimed at remediating a negative 27 parent-child relationship shall account for the behaviors that the child's disfavored parent may have contributed 28 29 to the negative parent-child relationship. 30 (9) Which party is more likely to maintain a loving,

- stable, consistent and nurturing relationship with the child adequate for the child's emotional needs.
 - (10) Which party is more likely to attend to the daily physical, emotional, developmental, educational and special needs of the child.
 - (11) The proximity of the residences of the parties.
 - (12) Each party's availability to care for the child or ability to make appropriate child-care arrangements.
 - (13) The level of conflict between the parties and the willingness and ability of the parties to cooperate with one another. A party's effort to protect a child from abuse by another party is not evidence of unwillingness or inability to cooperate with that party.
 - (14) The history of drug or alcohol abuse of a party or member of a party's household.
 - (15) The mental and physical condition of a party or member of a party's household[.], including, but not limited to, a risk to self, the child in particular or others, that creates a risk to the health and safety of the child or a party.
 - (15.1) Allegations of child abuse or a history of domestic violence in the presence of the child. The following shall apply:
- 24 (i) An evidentiary hearing limited to evidence

 25 related to the issue of child abuse or domestic violence

 26 shall be held if consideration is given under this

 27 paragraph.
- 28 <u>(ii) A parent's good faith disclosure of a</u>

 29 <u>communication to the parent by the child of child abuse</u>

 30 <u>or domestic violence shall not be a factor that weighs</u>

_	against the sale patent in determining custody.
2	(iii) If the court finds by clear and convincing
3	evidence an act of child abuse or a pattern of domestic
4	violence, including sexual abuse and trauma, by a parent,
5	the court shall award sole physical custody of the child
6	to the safe parent or party and shall suspend any
7	physical custody, except that it may award supervised
8	physical custody if it is in the best interest of the
9	child and supervised physical custody would protect the
10	health and safety of the child, to the parent engaged in
11	a pattern of domestic violence or abusive behavior. If a
12	parent shows by clear and convincing evidence that the
13	parent is no longer a threat to the health and safety of
14	the child after completion of a court-approved treatment
15	plan, the court may award custody other than supervised
16	physical custody to the parent. Any cost incurred for
17	supervised physical custody shall be paid by the abusing
18	parent.
19	(iv) Statements and testimony provided pursuant to
20	an evidentiary hearing under this paragraph may not be
21	used in another civil proceeding, criminal trial or any
22	other forum.
23	(15.2) Evidence of child abuse.
24	(16) Any other relevant factor.
25	(a.1) Conditions
26	(1) In considering the awarding of custody, including
27	psychological or medical theories proffered by the parties
28	under subsection (a), the court shall:
29	(i) Consider evidence of the parent's current mental
30	health condition and the risk that the parent will again

1	<u>subject the child or other household members to domestic</u>
2	abuse or unreasonably permit abuse to a child despite
3	having the ability to prevent the abuse.
4	(ii) Order custody only if the parent proves by
5	clear and convincing evidence that the custody is in the
6	best interest of the child and that the parent will not
7	cause any unreasonable physical, emotional or
8	psychological harm to the child.
9	(iii) In the case of a supervised physical custody
L O	imposed on a parent, order restrictions, conditions and
1	safeguards necessary to minimize any risk of harm to the
_2	child, including extending the supervised physical
13	custody.
4	(2) A supervised physical custody arrangement imposed on
15	a parent by a court shall be conducted by a court-approved
_6	professional in a therapeutic setting and under conditions
_7	that ensure the health and safety of the child. The
8	supervised physical custody arrangement shall not be
9	conducted in the parent's home and shall not extend
20	overnight. All costs of the supervision shall be paid by the
21	parent awarded supervised physical custody.
22	(3) No act of self-defense by a parent in response to
23	the family violence or domestic abuse of the other parent
24	shall be deemed family violence or domestic violence for the
25	purposes of this section.
26	(4) All costs, including the other parent's attorney
27	fees and the fees of any counsel for the child and all
28	treatment expenses incurred in compliance with this section,
29	shall be paid by the parent who is found to have committed
30	child abuse or domestic violence.

- 1 * * *
- 2 Section 5. Sections 5329(a), 5334(c), 5335(b) and 5339 of
- 3 Title 23 are amended to read:
- 4 § 5329. Consideration of criminal conviction.
- 5 (a) Offenses.--Where a party seeks any form of custody, the
- 6 court shall consider whether that party or member of that
- 7 party's household has been convicted of or has pleaded guilty or
- 8 no contest to any of the offenses in this section or an offense
- 9 in another jurisdiction substantially equivalent to any of the
- 10 offenses in this section. The court shall consider such conduct
- 11 and determine that the party does not pose a threat of harm to
- 12 the child before making any order of custody to that party when
- 13 considering the following offenses:
- 14 18 Pa.C.S. Ch. 25 (relating to criminal homicide).
- 15 18 Pa.C.S. § 2702 (relating to aggravated assault).
- 16 18 Pa.C.S. § 2706 (relating to terroristic threats).
- 17 18 Pa.C.S. § 2709.1 (relating to stalking).
- 18 Pa.C.S. § 2901 (relating to kidnapping).
- 19 18 Pa.C.S. § 2718 (relating to strangulation).
- 20 18 Pa.C.S. § 2902 (relating to unlawful restraint).
- 21 18 Pa.C.S. § 2903 (relating to false imprisonment).
- 22 18 Pa.C.S. § 2910 (relating to luring a child into a motor
- 23 vehicle or structure).
- 24 18 Pa.C.S. § 3121 (relating to rape).
- 25 18 Pa.C.S. § 3122.1 (relating to statutory sexual assault).
- 26 18 Pa.C.S. § 3123 (relating to involuntary deviate sexual
- 27 intercourse).
- 28 18 Pa.C.S. § 3124.1 (relating to sexual assault).
- 29 18 Pa.C.S. § 3125 (relating to aggravated indecent assault).
- 30 18 Pa.C.S. § 3126 (relating to indecent assault).

- 1 18 Pa.C.S. § 3127 (relating to indecent exposure).
- 2 18 Pa.C.S. § 3129 (relating to sexual intercourse with
- 3 animal).
- 4 18 Pa.C.S. § 3130 (relating to conduct relating to sex
- 5 offenders).
- 6 18 Pa.C.S. § 3301 (relating to arson and related offenses).
- 7 18 Pa.C.S. § 4302 (relating to incest).
- 8 18 Pa.C.S. § 4303 (relating to concealing death of child).
- 9 18 Pa.C.S. § 4304 (relating to endangering welfare of
- 10 children).
- 11 18 Pa.C.S. § 4305 (relating to dealing in infant children).
- 12 18 Pa.C.S. § 5902(b) (relating to prostitution and related
- 13 offenses).
- 14 18 Pa.C.S. § 5903(c) or (d) (relating to obscene and other
- 15 sexual materials and performances).
- 16 18 Pa.C.S. § 6301 (relating to corruption of minors).
- 17 18 Pa.C.S. § 6312 (relating to sexual abuse of children).
- 18 Pa.C.S. § 6318 (relating to unlawful contact with minor).
- 19 18 Pa.C.S. § 6320 (relating to sexual exploitation of
- 20 children).
- 21 Section 6114 (relating to contempt for violation of order or
- 22 agreement).
- 23 The former 75 Pa.C.S. § 3731 (relating to driving under
- 24 influence of alcohol or controlled substance).
- 25 75 Pa.C.S. Ch. 38 (relating to driving after imbibing alcohol
- 26 or utilizing drugs).
- 27 Section 13(a)(1) of the act of April 14, 1972 (P.L.233,
- 28 No.64), known as The Controlled Substance, Drug, Device and
- 29 Cosmetic Act, to the extent that it prohibits the manufacture,
- 30 sale or delivery, holding, offering for sale or possession of

- 1 any controlled substance or other drug or device.
- 2 * * *
- 3 § 5334. Guardian ad litem for child.
- 4 * * *
- 5 (c) Abuse.--If substantial allegations of abuse of the child
- 6 or substantial allegations of domestic violence which impacts
- 7 the child are made, the court shall appoint a quardian ad litem
- 8 for the child if:
- 9 (1) counsel for the child is not appointed under section
- 10 5335 (relating to counsel for child); [or]
- 11 (2) the court is satisfied that the relevant information
- will be presented to the court only with such appointment[.];
- 13 <u>or</u>
- 14 (3) the quardian ad litem establishes that the quardian
- ad litem received education and training under the program
- specified under 42 Pa.C.S. § 1908 (relating to child abuse
- 17 and domestic violence education and training program for
- 18 judges and court personnel) or substantially similar
- 19 training.
- 20 * * *
- 21 § 5335. Counsel for child.
- 22 * * *
- 23 (b) Abuse. -- Substantial allegations of abuse of the child
- 24 and substantial allegations of domestic violence which impacts
- 25 <u>the child</u> constitute a reasonable basis for appointing counsel
- 26 for the child.
- 27 * * *
- 28 § 5339. Award of counsel fees, costs and expenses.
- 29 <u>(a) Award.--</u>Under this chapter, a court may award reasonable
- 30 interim or final counsel fees, costs and expenses to a party if

- 1 the court finds that the conduct of another party was obdurate,
- 2 vexatious, repetitive or in bad faith.
- 3 (b) Other costs. -- The court may direct that a party who has
- 4 been found to have perpetrated abuse to pay all or a portion of
- 5 the fees, costs and expenses incurred by the other party,
- 6 <u>including attorney fees, costs relating to any counsel for the</u>
- 7 <u>child and treatment expenses incurred relating to the abuse.</u>
- 8 Section 6. Title 42 is amended by adding a section to read:
- 9 § 1908. Child abuse and domestic violence education and
- training program for judges and court personnel.
- 11 The Administrative Office of Pennsylvania Courts may develop
- 12 and implement an ongoing education and training program for
- 13 judges, including magisterial district judges, and relevant
- 14 court personnel, including guardians ad litem, regarding child
- 15 <u>abuse</u>, including child sexual abuse and trauma, domestic
- 16 violence and the impact of child abuse and domestic violence on
- 17 children. The education and training program shall include the
- 18 latest best practices from evidence-based and peer-reviewed
- 19 research. The education and training program shall be designed
- 20 to improve the ability of courts to recognize and respond to the
- 21 impact of child abuse, domestic violence and trauma on all
- 22 <u>victims</u>, specifically children, and make appropriate custody
- 23 decisions that are in the best interest of the child.
- Section 7. Section 5983(a) of Title 42 is amended to read:
- 25 § 5983. Rights and services.
- 26 (a) Designation of persons to act on behalf of children. --
- 27 Courts of common pleas may designate one or more persons as a
- 28 child advocate to provide the following services on behalf of
- 29 children who are involved in criminal proceedings as victims or
- 30 material witnesses[:] or children who are the subject of custody

- 1 proceedings and who are alleged to have been abused by a party
- 2 in the custody proceedings or have been impacted by domestic
- 3 violence perpetrated by a party in the custody proceedings:
- 4 (1) To explain, in language understood by the child, all legal proceedings in which the child will be involved.
- 6 (2) As a friend of the court, to advise the judge,
 7 whenever appropriate, of the child's ability to understand
 8 and cooperate with any court proceedings.
- 9 (3) To assist or secure assistance for the child and the 10 child's family in coping with the emotional impact of the 11 crime and subsequent criminal proceedings in which the child 12 is involved.
- 13 * * *
- 14 Section 8. This act shall take effect in 60 days.