
THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY OF PENNSYLVANIA

HOUSE BILL

No. 111 Session of
2019

INTRODUCED BY SCHEMEL, McCLINTON, SIMS, ISAACSON, LAWRENCE,
BURGOS, BULLOCK, TOBASH, BERNSTINE, JONES, HILL-EVANS, MOUL,
MULLINS AND DeLISSIO, APRIL 15, 2019

REFERRED TO COMMITTEE ON JUDICIARY, APRIL 15, 2019

A JOINT RESOLUTION

1 Proposing integrated amendments to the Constitution of the
2 Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, changing and adding provisions
3 relating to selection of justices and judges.

4 The General Assembly of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania
5 hereby resolves as follows:

6 Section 1. The following integrated amendments to the
7 Constitution of Pennsylvania are proposed in accordance with
8 Article XI:

9 (1) That section 8(b) of Article IV be amended to read:

10 § 8. Appointing power.

11 * * *

12 (b) [The] Except as provided in Article V, the Governor
13 shall fill vacancies in offices to which he appoints by
14 nominating to the Senate a proper person to fill the vacancy
15 within 90 days of the first day of the vacancy and not
16 thereafter. The Senate shall act on each executive nomination
17 within 25 legislative days of its submission. If the Senate has

1 not voted upon a nomination within 15 legislative days following
2 such submission, any five members of the Senate may, in writing,
3 request the presiding officer of the Senate to place the
4 nomination before the entire Senate body whereby the nomination
5 must be voted upon prior to the expiration of five legislative
6 days or 25 legislative days following submission by the
7 Governor, whichever occurs first. If the nomination is made
8 during a recess or after adjournment sine die, the Senate shall
9 act upon it within 25 legislative days after its return or
10 reconvening. If the Senate for any reason fails to act upon a
11 nomination submitted to it within the required 25 legislative
12 days, the nominee shall take office as if the appointment had
13 been consented to by the Senate. [The] Except as provided in
14 Article V, the Governor shall in a similar manner fill vacancies
15 in the offices of Auditor General, State Treasurer, [justice,
16 judge, justice of the peace] judge, magisterial district judge
17 and in any other elective office he is authorized to fill. In
18 the case of a vacancy in an elective office, a person shall be
19 elected to the office on the next election day appropriate to
20 the office unless the first day of the vacancy is within two
21 calendar months immediately preceding the election day in which
22 case the election shall be held on the second succeeding
23 election day appropriate to the office.

24 * * *

25 (2) That section 2 of Article V be amended to read:

26 § 2. Supreme Court.

27 The Supreme Court (a) shall be the highest court of the
28 Commonwealth and in this court shall be reposed the supreme
29 judicial power of the Commonwealth;

30 (b) shall consist of seven justices, to be selected as

1 provided in section 14, one of whom shall be the Chief Justice;
2 and

3 (c) shall have such jurisdiction as shall be provided by
4 law.

5 (3) That section 3 of Article V be amended to read:

6 § 3. Superior Court.

7 The Superior Court shall be a statewide court, and shall
8 consist of [the number of judges, which shall be not less than
9 seven judges] 15 judges, to be selected as provided in section
10 14, and have such jurisdiction as shall be provided by this
11 Constitution or by the General Assembly. One of its judges shall
12 be the president judge.

13 (4) That section 4 of Article V be amended to read:

14 § 4. Commonwealth Court.

15 The Commonwealth Court shall be a statewide court, and shall
16 consist of [the number of judges] nine judges, to be selected as
17 provided in section 14, and have such jurisdiction as shall be
18 provided by law. One of its judges shall be the president judge.

19 (5) That section 11 of Article V be amended to read:

20 § 11. Judicial districts; boundaries.

21 [The number and boundaries of judicial districts shall be
22 changed by the General Assembly only with the advice and consent
23 of the Supreme Court.]

24 (a) The General Assembly shall, by law, establish:

25 (1) An Eastern, Middle and Western judicial district,
26 congruent with the Federal United States District Court for the
27 Eastern District of Pennsylvania, United States District Court
28 for the Middle District of Pennsylvania and United States
29 District Court for the Western District of Pennsylvania, except
30 that Lancaster County, Berks County, Lehigh County and

1 Northampton County shall be part of the Middle judicial district
2 and Potter County, Tioga County, Cameron County, Clinton County,
3 Lycoming County, Centre County, Huntingdon County, Fulton County
4 and Franklin County shall be part of the Western judicial
5 district. Justices and judges shall be selected from the three
6 judicial districts as follows:

7 (i) Two justices of the Supreme Court shall be selected from
8 within each judicial district and shall be residents of the
9 judicial district. One justice shall be selected on a Statewide
10 basis and may be a resident of any of the judicial districts.

11 (ii) Five judges of the Superior Court shall be selected
12 from within each judicial district and shall be residents of the
13 judicial district.

14 (iii) Three judges of the Commonwealth Court shall be
15 selected from within each judicial district and shall be
16 residents of the judicial district.

17 (2) A transition to an appellate court judiciary selected
18 from judicial districts.

19 (3) The effect of set judicial districts upon eligibility to
20 seek retention.

21 (4) The order in which justices of the Supreme Court and
22 judges of the Superior Court and the Commonwealth Court are
23 selected.

24 (5) Notwithstanding any of the provisions of subsection (a)
25 (2), (3) or (4), that all current members of the appellate court
26 shall serve out their current terms and be eligible to seek
27 retention on the schedule provided by law at the time of their
28 election to the appellate court prior to the adoption of this
29 subsection.

30 (b) Residency qualification for appointment to the Supreme

1 Court, the Superior Court and the Commonwealth Court shall be
2 established by the General Assembly.

3 (c) Except as provided under subsection (b) and section
4 7(b), the number and boundaries of all other judicial districts
5 shall be established by the General Assembly by law, with the
6 advice and consent of the Supreme Court.

7 (6) That section 13 of Article V be amended to read:

8 § 13. [Election] Selection of justices, judges and [justices of
9 the peace] magisterial district judges; vacancies.

10 (a) [Justices, judges and justices of the peace] Judges,
11 other than judges of the Superior Court and Commonwealth Court,
12 and magisterial district judges shall be elected at the
13 municipal election next preceding the commencement of their
14 respective terms of office by the electors of the [Commonwealth
15 or the] respective districts in which they are to serve.

16 (b) A vacancy in the office of [justice, judge or justice of
17 the peace] judge, other than judge of the Superior Court and
18 Commonwealth Court, or magisterial district judge shall be
19 filled by appointment by the Governor. The appointment shall be
20 with the advice and consent of two-thirds of the members elected
21 to the Senate, except in the case of [justices of the peace]
22 magisterial district judges which shall be by a majority. The
23 person so appointed shall serve for a term ending on the first
24 Monday of January following the next municipal election more
25 than ten months after the vacancy occurs or for the remainder of
26 the unexpired term whichever is less. [, except in the case of
27 persons selected as additional judges to the Superior Court,
28 where the General Assembly may stagger and fix the length of the
29 initial terms of such additional judges by reference to any of
30 the first, second and third municipal elections more than ten

1 months after the additional judges are selected.] The manner by
2 which any additional judges are selected shall be provided by
3 this section for the filling of vacancies in judicial offices.

4 (b.1) (1) A vacancy in the office of justice of the Supreme
5 Court, and judge of the Superior Court and Commonwealth Court,
6 shall be filled by appointment by the Governor. The appointment
7 shall be for the initial term of each justice or judge. The
8 Governor shall nominate to the Senate individuals for
9 appointment exclusively from the list of individuals recommended
10 for appointment by the Appellate Court Nominating Commission
11 described under section 14, and the appointment shall be with
12 the advice and consent of two-thirds of the members elected to
13 the Senate. Within 30 days after receiving a list of
14 recommendations from the commission, the Governor shall nominate
15 to the Senate one individual from the list to fill the vacancy
16 for which the list was submitted. The Senate shall act on each
17 such nomination within 25 legislative days following the
18 submission. If the nomination is made during a recess or after
19 adjournment sine die, the Senate shall act upon it within 25
20 legislative days after its return or reconvening. If the Senate
21 has not voted upon a nomination within 15 legislative days
22 following submission of the nomination by the Governor or within
23 15 legislative days after its return or reconvening, any five
24 members of the Senate may, in writing, request the presiding
25 officer of the Senate to place the nomination before the entire
26 Senate body whereby the nomination must be voted upon prior to
27 the expiration of 25 legislative days following submission of
28 the nomination by the Governor or five legislative days
29 following the submission of the request by the members,
30 whichever occurs first. If the Senate fails to act upon a

1 nomination submitted under this paragraph, the nominee shall
2 take office as if the appointment had been consented to by the
3 Senate.

4 (2) If the Senate rejects the appointment of a nominee, the
5 Governor shall make a substitute nomination from the
6 commission's list within 30 days after the rejection from the
7 Senate. The Senate shall act upon the nomination in the manner
8 prescribed in paragraph (1). If the Senate rejects a total of
9 three nominations made for a specific vacancy, the commission
10 shall appoint any other individual on the list, the appointee
11 shall take office upon notification of the appointment by the
12 commission and neither the Governor nor the Senate shall
13 participate further in the appointment process for that vacancy.

14 (c) The provisions of section 13(b) shall not apply either
15 in the case of a vacancy to be filled by retention election as
16 provided in section 15(b), or in the case of a vacancy created
17 by failure of a [justice or] judge to file a declaration for
18 retention election as provided in section 15(b). In the case of
19 a vacancy occurring at the expiration of an appointive term
20 under section 13(b), the vacancy shall be filled by election as
21 provided in section 13(a).

22 [(d) At the primary election in 1969, the electors of the
23 Commonwealth may elect to have the justices and judges of the
24 Supreme, Superior, Commonwealth and all other statewide courts
25 appointed by the Governor from a list of persons qualified for
26 the offices submitted to him by the Judicial Qualifications
27 Commission. If a majority vote of those voting on the question
28 is in favor of this method of appointment, then whenever any
29 vacancy occurs thereafter for any reason in such court, the
30 Governor shall fill the vacancy by appointment in the manner

1 prescribed in this subsection. Such appointment shall not
2 require the consent of the Senate.]

3 (e) Each justice or judge of the Superior Court or
4 Commonwealth Court appointed by the Governor under section
5 [13(d)] 13(b.1) shall hold office for an initial term ending the
6 first Monday of January following the next municipal election
7 more than [24] 48 months following the appointment.

8 (7) That section 14 of Article V be amended to read:

9 § 14. [Judicial Qualifications] Appellate Court Nominating
10 Commission.

11 [(a) Should the method of judicial selection be adopted as
12 provided in section 13 (d), there shall be a Judicial
13 Qualifications Commission, composed of four non-lawyer electors
14 appointed by the Governor and three non-judge members of the bar
15 of the Supreme Court appointed by the Supreme Court. No more
16 than four members shall be of the same political party. The
17 members of the commission shall serve for terms of seven years,
18 with one member being selected each year. The commission shall
19 consider all names submitted to it and recommend to the Governor
20 not fewer than ten nor more than 20 of those qualified for each
21 vacancy to be filled.]

22 (b) During his term, no member shall hold a public office or
23 public appointment for which he receives compensation, nor shall
24 he hold office in a political party or political organization.

25 (c) A vacancy on the commission shall be filled by the
26 appointing authority for the balance of the term.]

27 (d) There shall be an independent board within the Executive
28 Department, known as the Appellate Court Nominating Commission,
29 the composition of which shall be as follows:

30 (1) The commission shall be composed of 13 members as

1 follows:

2 (i) Five individuals appointed by the Governor, four of whom
3 shall be members of the bar of the Supreme Court in good
4 standing and one of whom shall not be a member of the bar of the
5 Supreme Court or of any other jurisdiction. The members
6 appointed under this subparagraph shall reside in different
7 counties and no more than three members may be registered in the
8 same political party.

9 (ii) Two individuals appointed by the majority leader of the
10 Senate, one of whom shall be a member of the bar of the Supreme
11 Court in good standing and one of whom shall not be a member of
12 the bar of the Supreme Court or of any other jurisdiction. The
13 members appointed under this subparagraph shall reside in
14 different counties.

15 (iii) Two individuals appointed by the minority leader of
16 the Senate, one of whom shall be a member of the bar of the
17 Supreme Court in good standing and one of whom shall not be a
18 member of the bar of the Supreme Court or of any other
19 jurisdiction. The members appointed under this subparagraph
20 shall reside in different counties.

21 (iv) Two individuals appointed by the majority leader of the
22 House of Representatives, one of whom shall be a member of the
23 bar of the Supreme Court in good standing and one of whom shall
24 not be a member of the bar of the Supreme Court or of any other
25 jurisdiction. The members appointed under this subparagraph
26 shall reside in different counties.

27 (v) Two individuals appointed by the minority leader of the
28 House of Representatives, one of whom shall be a member of the
29 bar of the Supreme Court in good standing and one of whom shall
30 not be a member of the bar of the Supreme Court or of any other

1 jurisdiction. The members appointed under this subparagraph
2 shall reside in different counties.

3 (2) Except for the initial appointees whose terms shall be
4 staggered as provided by law, the members shall serve for terms
5 of four years. Each member must be at least 18 years of age and
6 a resident of this Commonwealth for at least one year
7 immediately prior to the member's appointment and throughout the
8 member's term on the commission.

9 (3) No member of the commission, during the member's term,
10 may hold office in a political party or political organization,
11 hold an appointed or elected public office, whether compensated
12 or uncompensated, or be an employee of the Commonwealth. An
13 individual who has held any of the foregoing positions within
14 one year prior to the individual's appointment shall not be
15 eligible to serve on the commission. The provisions of this
16 paragraph shall not prohibit a member from serving as a part-
17 time solicitor to a political subdivision.

18 (4) Membership on the commission shall terminate if a member
19 attains a position or characteristic that would have rendered
20 the member ineligible for appointment at the time of the
21 appointment. A vacancy shall be filled by the respective
22 appointing authority for the remainder of the term to which the
23 member was appointed. No member may serve for more than one full
24 term but may be reappointed after a lapse of four years. An
25 appointment of two years or less shall not be deemed a full
26 term. When making appointments, appointing authorities may
27 consider that the commission reflect the geographic, racial,
28 ethnic, gender and other diversity of this Commonwealth. The
29 General Assembly may provide for additional qualifications of
30 members of the commission, not inconsistent with this section,

1 as it deems appropriate in furthering the purposes of this
2 article.

3 (5) Members shall not be compensated for their services but
4 may be reimbursed for expenses necessarily incurred in the
5 discharge of their official duties.

6 (e) The Governor shall convene the first meeting of the
7 commission. At that meeting and annually thereafter, the members
8 of the commission shall elect a chairperson from among the
9 members. Except as provided in subsection (h), the commission
10 shall act only with the concurrence of a majority of its
11 members.

12 (f) The commission shall prescribe general rules governing
13 the conduct of members. A member may be removed by the
14 commission for a violation of the rules governing the conduct of
15 members.

16 (g) The commission may appoint staff as it deems necessary,
17 prepare and administer its own budget as provided by law,
18 exercise supervisory and administrative authority over staff and
19 commission functions, establish and promulgate its own rules of
20 procedure, prepare and disseminate an annual report and take
21 other actions as are necessary to ensure its efficient
22 operation. The General Assembly may authorize staff of other
23 Commonwealth agencies to assist the commission in the
24 commission's work. The budget request of the commission shall be
25 submitted to the General Assembly by the Governor as a separate
26 item in the budget of the Executive Department.

27 (h) Whenever a vacancy occurs in the office of justice of
28 the Supreme Court or judge of the Superior Court or Commonwealth
29 Court for a judicial district established under section 11, the
30 commission shall publicly announce the vacancy and solicit

1 applications for individuals who desire to be considered for the
2 vacancy. The General Assembly shall prescribe the timing for
3 solicitation of applications and the process for evaluation of
4 candidates by the commission. From the applications received,
5 the commission shall agree, by the affirmative votes of at least
6 10 of the members, to a list of five of the most qualified
7 individuals whose names will be submitted to the Governor for
8 consideration for appointment. In comprising the list, the
9 commission may consider that the appellate courts reflect the
10 racial, ethnic, gender and other diversity of this Commonwealth.
11 Only one list shall be compiled for each vacancy. Each
12 individual whose name is submitted to the Governor shall:

13 (1) be a resident of this Commonwealth for at least one year
14 immediately prior to submission of the individual's application;

15 (2) meet residency requirements under section 11(b), subject
16 to any other requirement established by law regarding judicial
17 districts;

18 (3) be a licensed member of the bar of the Supreme Court in
19 good standing; and

20 (4) for an aggregate of at least 10 years prior to the
21 individual's selection, have either practiced law or been
22 engaged in a law-related occupation.

23 (i) The General Assembly may provide for additional
24 procedures of the commission relating to the nomination of
25 candidates for judicial offices and for additional
26 qualifications of candidates, in both cases not inconsistent
27 with this section, as it deems appropriate in furthering the
28 purposes of this article.

29 (j) Members of the commission and its staff shall be
30 absolutely immune from suit for all conduct in the course of

1 their official duties.

2 (8) That section 15 of Article V be amended to read:

3 § 15. Tenure of justices, judges and [justices of the peace]
4 magisterial district judges.

5 (a) [The] Except as provided in section 13(e), the regular
6 term of office of justices and judges shall be ten years and the
7 regular term of office for judges of the municipal court and
8 traffic court in the City of Philadelphia and of [justices of
9 the peace] magisterial district judges shall be six years. The
10 tenure of any justice or judge shall not be affected by changes
11 in judicial districts or by reduction in the number of judges.

12 (b) A justice or judge elected or appointed under section
13 [13(a), appointed under section 13(d)] 13 or retained under this
14 section 15(b) may file a declaration of candidacy for retention
15 election with the officer of the Commonwealth who under law
16 shall have supervision over elections on or before the first
17 Monday of January of the year preceding the year in which [his]
18 the term of office of the justice or judge expires. If no
19 declaration is filed, a vacancy shall exist upon the expiration
20 of the term of office of such justice or judge, to be filled by
21 [election under section 13(a) or by appointment under section
22 13(d) if applicable] appointment or election under section 13.

23 If a justice or judge files a declaration, [his name] the name
24 of the justice or judge shall be submitted to the electors
25 without party designation, on a separate judicial ballot or in a
26 separate column on voting machines, at the municipal election
27 immediately preceding the expiration of the term of office of
28 the justice or judge, to determine only the question whether
29 [he] the justice or judge shall be retained in office. If a
30 majority is against retention, a vacancy shall exist upon the

1 expiration of [his] the term of office of that justice or judge,
2 to be filled by appointment under section [13(b) or under
3 section 13(d) if applicable] 13. If a majority favors retention,
4 the justice or judge shall serve for the regular term of office
5 provided herein, unless sooner removed or retired. At the
6 expiration of each term a justice or judge shall be eligible for
7 retention as provided herein, subject only to the retirement
8 provisions of this article.

9 Section 2. These proposed constitutional amendments will
10 become effective on January 1 next following approval by the
11 qualified electors of this Commonwealth under section 1 of
12 Article XI of the Constitution of Pennsylvania.

13 Section 3. (a) Upon the first passage by the General
14 Assembly of these proposed constitutional amendments, the
15 Secretary of the Commonwealth shall proceed immediately to
16 comply with the advertising requirements of section 1 of Article
17 XI of the Constitution of Pennsylvania and shall transmit the
18 required advertisements to two newspapers in every county in
19 which such newspapers are published in sufficient time after
20 passage of these proposed constitutional amendments.

21 (b) Upon the second passage by the General Assembly of these
22 proposed constitutional amendments, the Secretary of the
23 Commonwealth shall proceed immediately to comply with the
24 advertising requirements of section 1 of Article XI of the
25 Constitution of Pennsylvania and shall transmit the required
26 advertisements to two newspapers in every county in which such
27 newspapers are published in sufficient time after passage of
28 these proposed constitutional amendments. The Secretary of the
29 Commonwealth shall submit the proposed constitutional amendments
30 under section 1 of this resolution to the qualified electors of

1 this Commonwealth as a single ballot question at the first
2 general election which meets the requirements of and is in
3 conformance with section 1 of Article XI of the Constitution of
4 Pennsylvania and which occurs at least three months after the
5 proposed constitutional amendments are passed by the General
6 Assembly.