THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY OF PENNSYLVANIA

SENATE BILL No. 1087 ^{Session of} 2013

INTRODUCED BY LEACH, FERLO, BLAKE AND FARNESE, AUGUST 29, 2013

REFERRED TO JUDICIARY, AUGUST 29, 2013

AN ACT

| 1 2 3 | Amending Titles 18 (Crimes and Offenses) and 42 (Judiciary and Judicial Procedure) of the Pennsylvania Consolidated Statutes, prohibiting use of the death penalty. |
|-------------|---|
| 4 | The General Assembly of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania |
| 5 | hereby enacts as follows: |
| 6 | Section 1. Sections 1102(a) and 3301(b) of Title 18 of the |
| 7 | Pennsylvania Consolidated Statutes are amended to read: |
| 8 | § 1102. Sentence for murder, murder of unborn child and murder |
| 9 | of law enforcement officer. |
| 10 | (a) First degree |
| 11 | (1) Except as provided under section 1102.1 (relating to |
| 12 | sentence of persons under the age of 18 for murder, murder of |
| 13 | an unborn child and murder of a law enforcement officer), a |
| 14 | person who has been convicted of a murder of the first degree |
| 15 | or of murder of a law enforcement officer of the first degree |
| 16 | shall be sentenced to [death or to] a term of life |
| 17 | imprisonment in accordance with 42 Pa.C.S. § 9711 (relating |
| 18 | to sentencing procedure for murder of the first degree). |
| 19 | (2) The sentence for a person who has been convicted of |

first degree murder of an unborn child shall be the same as the sentence for murder of the first degree.[, except that the death penalty shall not be imposed. This paragraph shall not affect the determination of an aggravating circumstance under 42 Pa.C.S. § 9711(d)(17) for the killing of a pregnant woman.]

7 * * *

8 § 3301. Arson and related offenses. 9 * * *

10 (b) Sentence. -- A person convicted of violating the provisions of subsection (a)(2), murder of the first degree[,] 11 12 or second degree shall be sentenced to [death or] life 13 imprisonment without right to parole [; a person convicted of 14 murder of the second degree, pursuant to subsection (a)(2), 15 shall be sentenced to life imprisonment without right to 16 parole]. Notwithstanding provisions to the contrary, no language herein shall infringe upon the inherent powers of the Governor 17 18 to commute said sentence.

19 * * *

Section 2. Section 9711 of Title 42 is amended to read:
\$ 9711. Sentencing procedure for murder of the first degree.
[(a) Procedure in jury trials.--

(1)] After a verdict of murder of the first degree is
recorded [and before the jury is discharged], the court shall
[conduct a separate sentencing hearing in which the jury
shall determine whether the defendant shall be sentenced to
death or] <u>sentence the defendant to</u> life imprisonment.

[(2) In the sentencing hearing, evidence concerning the victim and the impact that the death of the victim has had on the family of the victim is admissible. Additionally,

20130SB1087PN1361

- 2 -

1 evidence may be presented as to any other matter that the court deems relevant and admissible on the question of the 2 3 sentence to be imposed. Evidence shall include matters relating to any of the aggravating or mitigating 4 5 circumstances specified in subsections (d) and (e), and 6 information concerning the victim and the impact that the 7 death of the victim has had on the family of the victim. 8 Evidence of aggravating circumstances shall be limited to 9 those circumstances specified in subsection (d).

10 (3) After the presentation of evidence, the court shall 11 permit counsel to present argument for or against the 12 sentence of death. The court shall then instruct the jury in 13 accordance with subsection (c).

14 (4) Failure of the jury to unanimously agree upon a
15 sentence shall not impeach or in any way affect the guilty
16 verdict previously recorded.

(b) Procedure in nonjury trials and guilty pleas.--If the defendant has waived a jury trial or pleaded guilty, the sentencing proceeding shall be conducted before a jury impaneled for that purpose unless waived by the defendant with the consent of the Commonwealth, in which case the trial judge shall hear the evidence and determine the penalty in the same manner as would a jury as provided in subsection (a).

24

(c) Instructions to jury.--

(1) Before the jury retires to consider the sentencing
verdict, the court shall instruct the jury on the following
matters:

(i) The aggravating circumstances specified in
subsection (d) as to which there is some evidence.
(ii) The mitigating circumstances specified in

20130SB1087PN1361

- 3 -

1

subsection (e) as to which there is some evidence.

2 (iii) Aggravating circumstances must be proved by 3 the Commonwealth beyond a reasonable doubt; mitigating 4 circumstances must be proved by the defendant by a 5 preponderance of the evidence.

6 (iv) The verdict must be a sentence of death if the 7 jury unanimously finds at least one aggravating 8 circumstance specified in subsection (d) and no 9 mitigating circumstance or if the jury unanimously finds 10 one or more aggravating circumstances which outweigh any 11 mitigating circumstances. The verdict must be a sentence 12 of life imprisonment in all other cases.

(v) The court may, in its discretion, discharge the jury if it is of the opinion that further deliberation will not result in a unanimous agreement as to the sentence, in which case the court shall sentence the defendant to life imprisonment.

The court shall instruct the jury that if it finds 18 (2)19 at least one aggravating circumstance and at least one 20 mitigating circumstance, it shall consider, in weighing the 21 aggravating and mitigating circumstances, any evidence 22 presented about the victim and about the impact of the murder 23 on the victim's family. The court shall also instruct the 24 jury on any other matter that may be just and proper under 25 the circumstances.

26 (d) Aggravating circumstances.--Aggravating circumstances27 shall be limited to the following:

(1) The victim was a firefighter, peace officer, public
servant concerned in official detention, as defined in 18
Pa.C.S. § 5121 (relating to escape), judge of any court in

- 4 -

1 the unified judicial system, the Attorney General of 2 Pennsylvania, a deputy attorney general, district attorney, 3 assistant district attorney, member of the General Assembly, Governor, Lieutenant Governor, Auditor General, State 4 5 Treasurer, State law enforcement official, local law enforcement official, Federal law enforcement official or 6 7 person employed to assist or assisting any law enforcement 8 official in the performance of his duties, who was killed in 9 the performance of his duties or as a result of his official 10 position.

11 (2) The defendant paid or was paid by another person or 12 had contracted to pay or be paid by another person or had 13 conspired to pay or be paid by another person for the killing 14 of the victim.

15 (3) The victim was being held by the defendant for16 ransom or reward, or as a shield or hostage.

17 (4) The death of the victim occurred while defendant was18 engaged in the hijacking of an aircraft.

19 (5) The victim was a prosecution witness to a murder or 20 other felony committed by the defendant and was killed for 21 the purpose of preventing his testimony against the defendant 22 in any grand jury or criminal proceeding involving such 23 offenses.

24 (6) The defendant committed a killing while in the25 perpetration of a felony.

26 (7) In the commission of the offense the defendant
27 knowingly created a grave risk of death to another person in
28 addition to the victim of the offense.

29 (8) The offense was committed by means of torture.30 (9) The defendant has a significant history of felony

20130SB1087PN1361

- 5 -

1 convictions involving the use or threat of violence to the 2 person.

3 (10) The defendant has been convicted of another Federal 4 or State offense, committed either before or at the time of 5 the offense at issue, for which a sentence of life 6 imprisonment or death was imposable or the defendant was 7 undergoing a sentence of life imprisonment for any reason at 8 the time of the commission of the offense.

9 (11) The defendant has been convicted of another murder 10 committed in any jurisdiction and committed either before or 11 at the time of the offense at issue.

12 (12) The defendant has been convicted of voluntary 13 manslaughter, as defined in 18 Pa.C.S. § 2503 (relating to 14 voluntary manslaughter), or a substantially equivalent crime 15 in any other jurisdiction, committed either before or at the 16 time of the offense at issue.

17 The defendant committed the killing or was an (13)18 accomplice in the killing, as defined in 18 Pa.C.S. 306(c) 19 (relating to liability for conduct of another; complicity), 20 while in the perpetration of a felony under the provisions of 21 the act of April 14, 1972 (P.L.233, No.64), known as The 22 Controlled Substance, Drug, Device and Cosmetic Act, and 23 punishable under the provisions of 18 Pa.C.S. § 7508 24 (relating to drug trafficking sentencing and penalties).

(14) At the time of the killing, the victim was or had been involved, associated or in competition with the defendant in the sale, manufacture, distribution or delivery of any controlled substance or counterfeit controlled substance in violation of The Controlled Substance, Drug, Device and Cosmetic Act or similar law of any other state,

20130SB1087PN1361

- 6 -

the District of Columbia or the United States, and the defendant committed the killing or was an accomplice to the killing as defined in 18 Pa.C.S. § 306(c), and the killing resulted from or was related to that association, involvement or competition to promote the defendant's activities in selling, manufacturing, distributing or delivering controlled substances or counterfeit controlled substances.

8 (15) At the time of the killing, the victim was or had 9 been a nongovernmental informant or had otherwise provided any investigative, law enforcement or police agency with 10 11 information concerning criminal activity and the defendant 12 committed the killing or was an accomplice to the killing as 13 defined in 18 Pa.C.S. § 306(c), and the killing was in 14 retaliation for the victim's activities as a nongovernmental 15 informant or in providing information concerning criminal 16 activity to an investigative, law enforcement or police 17 agency.

18

(16) The victim was a child under 12 years of age.

19 (17) At the time of the killing, the victim was in her 20 third trimester of pregnancy or the defendant had knowledge 21 of the victim's pregnancy.

22 (18) At the time of the killing the defendant was 23 subject to a court order restricting in any way the 24 defendant's behavior toward the victim pursuant to 23 Pa.C.S. 25 Ch. 61 (relating to protection from abuse) or any other order 26 of a court of common pleas or of the minor judiciary designed 27 in whole or in part to protect the victim from the defendant. 28 (e) Mitigating circumstances. --Mitigating circumstances 29 shall include the following:

30 (1) The defendant has no significant history of prior 20130SB1087PN1361 - 7 - 1 criminal convictions.

2 (2) The defendant was under the influence of extreme3 mental or emotional disturbance.

4 (3) The capacity of the defendant to appreciate the
5 criminality of his conduct or to conform his conduct to the
6 requirements of law was substantially impaired.

7

(4) The age of the defendant at the time of the crime.

8 (5) The defendant acted under extreme duress, although 9 not such duress as to constitute a defense to prosecution 10 under 18 Pa.C.S. § 309 (relating to duress), or acted under 11 the substantial domination of another person.

12 (6) The victim was a participant in the defendant's13 homicidal conduct or consented to the homicidal acts.

14 (7) The defendant's participation in the homicidal act15 was relatively minor.

16 (8) Any other evidence of mitigation concerning the
17 character and record of the defendant and the circumstances
18 of his offense.

19 (f) Sentencing verdict by the jury.--

(1) After hearing all the evidence and receiving the instructions from the court, the jury shall deliberate and render a sentencing verdict. In rendering the verdict, if the sentence is death, the jury shall set forth in such form as designated by the court the findings upon which the sentence is based.

(2) Based upon these findings, the jury shall set forth
in writing whether the sentence is death or life
imprisonment.

(g) Recording sentencing verdict.--Whenever the jury shallagree upon a sentencing verdict, it shall be received and

20130SB1087PN1361

- 8 -

recorded by the court. The court shall thereafter impose upon
 the defendant the sentence fixed by the jury.

3 (h) Review of death sentence.--

4 (1) A sentence of death shall be subject to automatic
5 review by the Supreme Court of Pennsylvania pursuant to its
6 rules.

7 (2) In addition to its authority to correct errors at 8 trial, the Supreme Court shall either affirm the sentence of 9 death or vacate the sentence of death and remand for further 10 proceedings as provided in paragraph (4).

11 (3) The Supreme Court shall affirm the sentence of death 12 unless it determines that:

(i) the sentence of death was the product of
passion, prejudice or any other arbitrary factor; or

15 (ii) the evidence fails to support the finding of at 16 least one aggravating circumstance specified in 17 subsection (d).

18 (4) If the Supreme Court determines that the death 19 penalty must be vacated because none of the aggravating 20 circumstances are supported by sufficient evidence, then it 21 shall remand for the imposition of a life imprisonment 22 sentence. If the Supreme Court determines that the death 23 penalty must be vacated for any other reason, it shall remand 24 for a new sentencing hearing pursuant to subsections (a) 25 through (g).

(i) Record of death sentence to Governor.--Where a sentence
of death is upheld by the Supreme Court, the prothonotary of the
Supreme Court shall transmit to the Governor a full and complete
record of the trial, sentencing hearing, imposition of sentence,
opinion and order by the Supreme Court within 30 days of one of

20130SB1087PN1361

- 9 -

1 the following, whichever occurs first:

2 (1) the expiration of the time period for filing a
3 petition for writ of certiorari or extension thereof where
4 neither has been filed;

5 (2) the denial of a petition for writ of certiorari; or 6 (3) the disposition of the appeal by the United States 7 Supreme Court, if that court grants the petition for writ of 8 certiorari.

9 Notice of this transmission shall contemporaneously be provided 10 to the Secretary of Corrections.]

Section 3. This act shall apply to defendants and individuals who have not been sentenced as of the effective date

13 of this section.

14 Section 4. This act shall take effect in 60 days.