## THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY OF PENNSYLVANIA

# HOUSE BILL No. 1801 Session of 2017

INTRODUCED BY NESBIT, BRIGGS, D. COSTA, GILLEN, A. HARRIS, HEFFLEY, JAMES, McCLINTON, NEILSON, O'NEILL, PICKETT, READSHAW, ROZZI, SCHLOSSBERG, SOLOMON AND WARD, OCTOBER 3, 2017

REFERRED TO COMMITTEE ON JUDICIARY, OCTOBER 3, 2017

#### AN ACT

1 2 3	Amending Title 42 (Judiciary and Judicial Procedure) of the Pennsylvania Consolidated Statutes, in post-trial matters, further providing for postconviction DNA testing.
4	The General Assembly of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania
5	hereby enacts as follows:
6	Section 1. Section 9543.1 of Title 42 of the Pennsylvania
7	Consolidated Statutes is amended to read:
8	§ 9543.1. Postconviction DNA testing.
9	(a) Motion
10	(1) An individual convicted of a criminal offense in a
11	court of this Commonwealth [and serving a term of
12	imprisonment or awaiting execution because of a sentence of
13	death] may apply by making a written motion to the sentencing
14	court <u>at any time</u> for the performance of forensic DNA testing
15	on specific evidence that is related to the investigation or
16	prosecution that resulted in the judgment of conviction.
17	(2) The evidence may have been discovered either prior

1 to or after the applicant's conviction. The evidence shall be available for testing as of the date of the motion. If the 2 3 evidence was discovered prior to the applicant's conviction, 4 the evidence shall not have been subject to the DNA testing 5 requested [because the technology for testing was not in 6 existence at the time of the trial or the applicant's counsel 7 did not seek testing at the time of the trial in a case where 8 a verdict was rendered on or before January 1, 1995], or the 9 evidence was subject to the testing, but newer technology could provide more accurate and probative results, or the 10 applicant's counsel sought funds from the court to pay for 11 12 the testing because his client was indigent and the court 13 refused the request despite the client's indigency. 14 (3) A request for DNA testing under this section shall 15 be by written petition and shall be filed with the clerk of courts of the judicial district where the sentence is 16 17 imposed. 18 (4) DNA testing may be sought at any time if the motion 19 is made in a timely manner and for the purpose of 20 demonstrating the applicant's actual innocence and not to 21 delay the execution of sentence or administration of 22 justice. There shall be a presumption of timeliness whenever the record does not affirmatively establish that the motion 23 24 was filed to delay the execution of sentence or 25 administration of justice. 26 (5) Notwithstanding any other provision of law, a plea 27 of quilty or a confession given by an applicant concerning the offense for which the applicant was convicted shall not 28 29 prohibit the applicant from asserting actual innocence under subsection (c)(2) or the court from making a determination 30

20170HB1801PN2531

- 2 -

1 and ordering DNA testing under subsection (d)(2).

2

(b) Notice to the Commonwealth.--

3 (1) Upon receipt of a motion under subsection (a), the
4 court shall notify the Commonwealth and shall afford the
5 Commonwealth an opportunity to respond to the motion.

6 (2) Upon receipt of a motion under subsection (a) or 7 notice of the motion, as applicable, the Commonwealth and the 8 court shall take the steps reasonably necessary to ensure 9 that any remaining biological material in the possession of 10 the Commonwealth or the court is preserved pending the 11 completion of the proceedings under this section.

12 (3) Upon receipt of a written petition for DNA testing 13 by an applicant, the Commonwealth and the district attorney 14 shall prepare an inventory of all evidence and traces of 15 evidence related to the case and serve a copy of the 16 inventory to the prosecution, the applicant, the applicant's 17 attorney, if applicable, and the court. The inventory shall 18 include all evidence collected, including, but not limited

19 <u>to, all of the following:</u>

20 (i) Any traces of evidence retained from previous
 21 testing procedures, slides, swabs or other laboratory
 22 samples.

23 (ii) A list of all locations searched.

24 (iii) An accounting of all forensic testing

25 previously done relating to the evidence and the names of 26 the individuals who conducted the forensic testing.

27 (c) Requirements.--In any motion under subsection (a), under 28 penalty of perjury, the applicant shall:

29 30

(ii) state that the applicant consents to provide

20170HB1801PN2531

(1)

- 3 -

(i) specify the evidence to be tested;

1

samples of bodily fluid for use in the DNA testing; and

(iii) acknowledge that the applicant understands
that, if the motion is granted, any data obtained from
any DNA samples or test results may be entered into law
enforcement databases, may be used in the investigation
of other crimes and may be used as evidence against the
applicant in other cases.

8 (2)(i) in a sworn statement subject to the penalties under 18 Pa.C.S. §§ 4902 (relating to perjury) and 4903 9 10 (relating to false swearing), assert the applicant's 11 actual innocence of the offense for which the applicant 12 was convicted and that the applicant seeks DNA testing 13 for the purpose of demonstrating the applicant's actual 14 innocence; and

15

(ii) in a capital case:

(A) assert the applicant's actual innocence of
the charged or uncharged conduct constituting an
aggravating circumstance under section 9711(d)
(relating to sentencing procedure for murder of the
first degree) if the applicant's exoneration of the
conduct would result in vacating a sentence of death;
or

(B) assert that the outcome of the DNA testing
would establish a mitigating circumstance under
section 9711(e)(7) if that mitigating circumstance
was presented to the sentencing judge or jury and
facts as to that issue were in dispute at the
sentencing hearing.

(3) present a prima facie case demonstrating that the:
(i) identity of or the participation in the crime by

20170HB1801PN2531

- 4 -

1 the perpetrator was at issue in the proceedings that 2 resulted in the applicant's conviction and sentencing; 3 and

4 (ii) DNA testing of the specific evidence, assuming
5 exculpatory results, would establish:

6 (A) the applicant's actual innocence of the 7 offense for which the applicant was convicted;

8 (B) in a capital case, the applicant's actual 9 innocence of the charged or uncharged conduct 10 constituting an aggravating circumstance under 11 section 9711(d) if the applicant's exoneration of the 12 conduct would result in vacating a sentence of death; 13 or

14 (C) in a capital case, a mitigating circumstance
15 under section 9711(e)(7) under the circumstances set
16 forth in subsection (c)(1)(iv).

17 (d) Order.--

(1) Except as provided in paragraph (2), the court shall order the testing requested in a motion under subsection (a) under reasonable conditions designed to preserve the integrity of the evidence and the testing process upon a determination, after review of the record of the applicant's trial, that the:

24 (i) requirements of subsection (c) have been met;
25 and

(ii) evidence to be tested has been subject to a
chain of custody sufficient to establish that it has not
been altered in any material respect.[; and

(iii) motion is made in a timely manner and for the
 purpose of demonstrating the applicant's actual innocence

20170HB1801PN2531

- 5 -

1

2

## and not to delay the execution of sentence or

### administration of justice.]

3 (2) The court shall [not] order the testing requested in 4 a motion under subsection (a) if, after review of the record 5 of the applicant's trial, the court determines that there is 6 [no] <u>a</u> reasonable possibility that <u>assuming exculpatory</u> 7 <u>results</u> the testing would produce [exculpatory] evidence 8 that:

9

10

(i) would establish the applicant's actual innocence of the offense for which the applicant was convicted;

(ii) in a capital case, would establish the applicant's actual innocence of the charged or uncharged conduct constituting an aggravating circumstance under section 9711(d) if the applicant's exoneration of the conduct would result in vacating a sentence of death; or

16 (iii) in a capital case, would establish a
17 mitigating circumstance under section 9711(e)(7) under
18 the circumstances set forth in subsection (c)(1)(iv).

<u>(3) Any DNA testing order under this section shall</u>
 <u>constitute a final order. An applicant or the Commonwealth</u>

21 <u>may appeal a decision denying or granting a DNA testing order</u>

22 <u>in accordance with the Pennsylvania Rules of Appellate</u>

23 <u>Procedure</u>.

24 (4) As used in this subsection, the term "exculpatory
 25 results" includes, but is not limited to, DNA testing results
 26 that indicate any of the following:

27 (i) An unidentified DNA profile on the evidence
28 tested.

29 (ii) A match to another person's DNA profile.
30 (iii) A match to a DNA profile other than the

20170HB1801PN2531

- 6 -

1	applicant's from an unsolved crime that may be contained
2	<u>in a DNA database.</u>
3	(e) Testing procedures
4	(1) Any DNA testing ordered under this section shall be
5	conducted by:
6	(i) a laboratory mutually selected by the
7	Commonwealth and the applicant;
8	(ii) <u>a laboratory selected by the court that ordered</u>
9	the testing if the Commonwealth and the applicant are
10	unable to agree on a laboratory[, a laboratory selected
11	by the court that ordered the testing]; or
12	(iii) if the applicant is indigent, the testing
13	shall be conducted by the Pennsylvania State Police or,
14	at the Pennsylvania State Police's sole discretion, by a
15	laboratory designated by the Pennsylvania State Police.
16	(2) The costs of any testing ordered under this section
17	shall be paid:
18	(i) by the applicant; or
19	(ii) in the case of an applicant who is indigent, by
20	the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania.
21	(3) [Testing conducted by the Pennsylvania State Police
22	shall be carried out in accordance with the protocols and
23	procedures established by the Pennsylvania State Police.] <u>To</u>
24	the extent possible and not inconsistent with best laboratory
25	practices, the testing shall be conducted in a manner that
26	ensures that some portion of the sample is preserved for
27	replication of testing. If the laboratory determines it may
28	be necessary to consume the entirety of any sample during
29	testing, the laboratory shall inform the prosecution, the
30	applicant and the applicant's attorney, if applicable, of its
20170H	B1801PN2531 - 7 -

1	recommendation and obtain the prosecution and the applicant's
2	consent before proceeding. If the prosecution and the
3	applicant do not consent, the court may issue any appropriate
4	order before testing proceeds.
5	(4) If testing is performed by a private laboratory and
6	a DNA database search is anticipated, the applicant shall
7	ensure that the chosen laboratory is accredited and compliant
8	with Federal Bureau of Investigation quality assurance
9	standards.
10	(5) When testing is performed by a private laboratory,
11	the Commonwealth shall take all reasonable measures before
12	the testing is conducted to ensure that the results of the
13	testing may be entered into CODIS so that a comparison to
14	known offender or crime scene profiles may be made if the
15	laboratory and test results otherwise satisfy the criteria
16	<u>for database entry.</u>
17	(6) Testing conducted by the Pennsylvania State Police
18	shall be carried out in accordance with the protocols and
1 0	
19	procedures established by the Pennsylvania State Police.
20	procedures established by the Pennsylvania State Police. (f) Posttesting procedures
20	(f) Posttesting procedures
20 21	<ul><li>(f) Posttesting procedures</li><li>(1) After the DNA testing conducted under this section</li></ul>
20 21 22	<ul><li>(f) Posttesting procedures</li><li>(1) After the DNA testing conducted under this section</li><li>has been completed, the applicant may, pursuant to section</li></ul>
20 21 22 23	<pre>(f) Posttesting procedures    (1) After the DNA testing conducted under this section has been completed, the applicant may, pursuant to section 9545(b)(2) (relating to jurisdiction and proceedings), during</pre>
20 21 22 23 24	<pre>(f) Posttesting procedures    (1) After the DNA testing conducted under this section has been completed, the applicant may, pursuant to section 9545(b)(2) (relating to jurisdiction and proceedings), during the 60-day period beginning on the date on which the</pre>
20 21 22 23 24 25	<pre>(f) Posttesting procedures    (1) After the DNA testing conducted under this section has been completed, the applicant may, pursuant to section 9545(b)(2) (relating to jurisdiction and proceedings), during the 60-day period beginning on the date on which the applicant is notified of the test results, petition to the</pre>
20 21 22 23 24 25 26	(f) Posttesting procedures (1) After the DNA testing conducted under this section has been completed, the applicant may, pursuant to section 9545(b)(2) (relating to jurisdiction and proceedings), during the 60-day period beginning on the date on which the applicant is notified of the test results, petition to the court for postconviction relief pursuant to section 9543(a)
20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27	(f) Posttesting procedures (1) After the DNA testing conducted under this section has been completed, the applicant may, pursuant to section 9545(b)(2) (relating to jurisdiction and proceedings), during the 60-day period beginning on the date on which the applicant is notified of the test results, petition to the court for postconviction relief pursuant to section 9543(a) (2)(vi) (relating to eligibility for relief).

- 8 -

1 thereon.

In any hearing on a petition for postconviction 2 (3)relief filed under paragraph (1), the court shall determine 3 whether the exculpatory evidence resulting from the DNA 4 5 testing conducted under this section would have changed the outcome of the trial as required by section 9543(a)(2)(vi) 6 7 (4) If testing complies with Federal Bureau of Investigation requirements and the data meets NDIS criteria, 8 9 profiles obtained from the testing shall be searched or 10 uploaded to CODIS. (5) When testing is conducted by a private laboratory, a 11 court may order a public laboratory with access to CODIS to 12 13 take the necessary measures to ensure the DNA profile 14 obtained from probative biological material from crime scene evidence can be uploaded to CODIS by the public laboratory. 15 Necessary measures may include requiring the public 16 17 laboratory to conduct a review of the private laboratory's 18 facilities or records to ensure that the private laboratory 19 complies with Federal Bureau of Investigation requirements 20 regarding CODIS. If the private laboratory meets Federal Bureau of Investigation and CODIS requirements, the court may 21 22 order the public laboratory to upload the DNA profile to determine whether the profile matches a profile of a known 23 24 individual or a profile from an unsolved crime. The DNA 25 profile submitted to the databases must comply with the 26 Federal Bureau of Investigation requirements for the 27 uploading of DNA profiles to CODIS, and the Commonwealth shall take all reasonable measures to ensure that the testing 28 29 complies with the requirements. 30 (6) If DNA testing conclusively identifies the DNA

- 9 -

profile of the applicant on probative and inculpatory
 evidence, the court shall dismiss the petition and may make
 any further orders that are appropriate. An order under this
 paragraph may:
 (i) direct that the Pennsylvania Board of Probation

and Parole be notified of the test results; or
(ii) mandate that the applicant's DNA profile be
added to the Commonwealth's convicted offender database.
(g) Effect of motion.--The filing of a motion for forensic
DNA testing pursuant to subsection (a) shall have the following
effect:

12 (1) The filing of the motion shall constitute the
13 applicant's consent to provide samples of bodily fluid for
14 use in the DNA testing.

15 (2) The data from any DNA samples or test results 16 obtained as a result of the motion may be entered into law 17 enforcement databases, may be used in the investigation of 18 other crimes and may be used as evidence against the 19 applicant in other cases.

20 (h) Definitions.--As used in this section, the following 21 words and phrases shall have the meanings given to them in this 22 subsection:

23 "Applicant." The individual who files a motion under 24 subsection (a).

25 <u>"CODIS." The Combined DNA Index System administered by the</u>
26 <u>Federal Bureau of Investigation that allows for the storage and</u>
27 <u>exchange of DNA records submitted by Federal, State and local</u>
28 forensic DNA laboratories.

29 "DNA." Deoxyribonucleic acid.

30 "NDIS." The National DNA Index System which is the national

20170HB1801PN2531

- 10 -

1 DNA database system of DNA records and meets Federal quality

2 <u>assurance and privacy standards.</u>

- 3 <u>"Public laboratory." The Pennsylvania State Police DNA</u>
- 4 Laboratory, the Philadelphia Police Department Office of
- 5 Forensic Sciences DNA Laboratory, the Allegheny County DNA
- 6 Laboratory or any other laboratory maintained by the
- 7 <u>Commonwealth with access to CODIS.</u>
- 8 Section 2. This act shall take effect in 60 days.