THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY OF PENNSYLVANIA

SENATE BILL

No. 1134 Session of 2015

INTRODUCED BY GREENLEAF, TEPLITZ, LEACH, FARNESE, YUDICHAK, BARTOLOTTA, FONTANA, VANCE, RESCHENTHALER, HAYWOOD, BROWNE, VOGEL AND SCARNATI, MARCH 4, 2016

REFERRED TO JUDICIARY, MARCH 4, 2016

AN ACT

- Amending Title 42 (Judiciary and Judicial Procedure) of the Pennsylvania Consolidated Statutes, in post-trial matters,
- further providing for postconviction DNA testing.
- 4 The General Assembly of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania
- 5 hereby enacts as follows:
- 6 Section 1. Section 9543.1 of Title 42 of the Pennsylvania
- 7 Consolidated Statutes is amended to read:
- 8 § 9543.1. Postconviction DNA testing.
- 9 (a) Motion.--
- 10 (1) An individual convicted of a criminal offense in a
- 11 court of this Commonwealth [and serving a term of
- 12 imprisonment or awaiting execution because of a sentence of
- death] may apply by making a written motion to the sentencing
- 14 court at any time for the performance of forensic DNA testing
- on specific evidence that is related to the investigation or
- 16 prosecution that resulted in the judgment of conviction.
- 17 (2) The evidence may have been discovered either prior
- 18 to or after the applicant's conviction. The evidence shall be

available for testing as of the date of the motion. If the evidence was discovered prior to the applicant's conviction,

3 the evidence shall not have been subject to the DNA testing

4 requested [because the technology for testing was not in

existence at the time of the trial or the applicant's counsel

did not seek testing at the time of the trial in a case where

a verdict was rendered on or before January 1, 1995], or the

evidence was subject to the testing, but newer technology

could provide more accurate and probative results, or the

applicant's counsel sought funds from the court to pay for

the testing because his client was indigent and the court

refused the request despite the client's indigency.

- (3) A request for DNA testing under this section shall be by written petition and shall be filed with the clerk of courts of the judicial district where the sentence is imposed.
- (4) DNA testing may be sought at any time if the motion is made in a timely manner and for the purpose of demonstrating the applicant's actual innocence and not to delay the execution of sentence or administration of justice. There shall be a presumption of timeliness whenever the record does not affirmatively establish that the motion was filed to delay the execution of sentence or
 - (5) Notwithstanding any other provision of law, a plea of guilty or a confession given by an applicant concerning the offense for which the applicant was convicted shall not prohibit the applicant from asserting actual innocence under subsection (c)(2) or the court from making a determination and ordering DNA testing under subsection (d)(2).

administration of justice.

(b) Notice to the Commonwealth.--

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

- (1) Upon receipt of a motion under subsection (a), the court shall notify the Commonwealth and shall afford the Commonwealth an opportunity to respond to the motion.
- (2) Upon receipt of a motion under subsection (a) or notice of the motion, as applicable, the Commonwealth and the court shall take the steps reasonably necessary to ensure that any remaining biological material in the possession of the Commonwealth or the court is preserved pending the completion of the proceedings under this section.
- (3) Upon receipt of a written petition for DNA testing by an applicant, the Commonwealth and the district attorney shall prepare an inventory of all evidence and traces of evidence related to the case and serve a copy of the inventory to the prosecution, the applicant, the applicant's attorney, if applicable, and the court. The inventory shall include all evidence collected, including, but not limited to, all of the following:
- (i) Any traces of evidence retained from previous
 testing procedures, slides, swabs or other laboratory
 samples.
- 22 <u>(ii) A list of all locations searched.</u>
- 23 (iii) An accounting of all forensic testing

 24 previously done relating to the evidence and the names of

 25 the individuals who conducted the forensic testing.
- 26 (c) Requirements.--In any motion under subsection (a), under 27 penalty of perjury, the applicant shall:
- 28 (1) (i) specify the evidence to be tested;
- 29 (ii) state that the applicant consents to provide 30 samples of bodily fluid for use in the DNA testing; and

- (iii) acknowledge that the applicant understands
 that, if the motion is granted, any data obtained from
 any DNA samples or test results may be entered into law
 enforcement databases, may be used in the investigation
 of other crimes and may be used as evidence against the
 applicant in other cases.
 - (2) (i) in a sworn statement subject to the penalties under 18 Pa.C.S. §§ 4902 (relating to perjury) and 4903 (relating to false swearing), assert the applicant's actual innocence of the offense for which the applicant was convicted and that the applicant seeks DNA testing for the purpose of demonstrating the applicant's actual innocence; and
 - (ii) in a capital case:
 - (A) assert the applicant's actual innocence of the charged or uncharged conduct constituting an aggravating circumstance under section 9711(d) (relating to sentencing procedure for murder of the first degree) if the applicant's exoneration of the conduct would result in vacating a sentence of death; or
 - (B) assert that the outcome of the DNA testing would establish a mitigating circumstance under section 9711(e)(7) if that mitigating circumstance was presented to the sentencing judge or jury and facts as to that issue were in dispute at the sentencing hearing.
 - (3) present a prima facie case demonstrating that the:
 - (i) identity of or the participation in the crime by the perpetrator was at issue in the proceedings that

1	resulted in the applicant's conviction and sentencing;
2	and
3	(ii) DNA testing of the specific evidence, assuming
4	exculpatory results, would establish:
5	(A) the applicant's actual innocence of the
6	offense for which the applicant was convicted;
7	(B) in a capital case, the applicant's actual
8	innocence of the charged or uncharged conduct
9	constituting an aggravating circumstance under
10	section 9711(d) if the applicant's exoneration of the
11	conduct would result in vacating a sentence of death;
12	or
13	(C) in a capital case, a mitigating circumstance
14	under section 9711(e)(7) under the circumstances set
15	forth in subsection (c)(1)(iv).
16	(d) Order
17	(1) Except as provided in paragraph (2), the court shall
18	order the testing requested in a motion under subsection (a)
19	under reasonable conditions designed to preserve the
20	integrity of the evidence and the testing process upon a
21	determination, after review of the record of the applicant's
22	trial, that the:
23	(i) requirements of subsection (c) have been met;
24	<u>and</u>
25	(ii) evidence to be tested has been subject to a
26	chain of custody sufficient to establish that it has not
27	been altered in any material respect[; and
28	(iii) motion is made in a timely manner and for the
29	purpose of demonstrating the applicant's actual innocence
3.0	and not to delay the execution of sentence or

1		_		
1	administration	Οİ	lusticel	

(2) The court shall [not] order the testing requested in a motion under subsection (a) if, after review of the record of the applicant's trial, the court determines that there is [no] a reasonable possibility that assuming exculpatory results the testing would produce [exculpatory] evidence that:

- (i) would establish the applicant's actual innocence of the offense for which the applicant was convicted;
- (ii) in a capital case, would establish the applicant's actual innocence of the charged or uncharged conduct constituting an aggravating circumstance under section 9711(d) if the applicant's exoneration of the conduct would result in vacating a sentence of death; or
- (iii) in a capital case, would establish a
 mitigating circumstance under section 9711(e)(7) under
 the circumstances set forth in subsection (c)(1)(iv).
- (3) Any DNA testing order under this section shall constitute a final order. An applicant or the Commonwealth may appeal a decision denying or granting a DNA testing order in accordance with the Pennsylvania Rules of Appellate Procedure.
- (4) As used in this subsection, the term "exculpatory results" includes, but is not limited to, DNA testing results that indicate any of the following:
- 26 <u>(i) An unidentified DNA profile on the evidence</u>
 27 tested.
- 28 <u>(ii) A match to another person's DNA profile.</u>
- 29 <u>(iii) A match to a DNA profile other than the</u>
 30 <u>applicant's from an unsolved crime that may be contained</u>

in a DNA database.

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

- 2 (e) Testing procedures.--
- 3 (1) Any DNA testing ordered under this section shall be conducted by:
 - (i) a laboratory mutually selected by the Commonwealth and the applicant;
 - (ii) a laboratory selected by the court that ordered the testing if the Commonwealth and the applicant are unable to agree on a laboratory[, a laboratory selected by the court that ordered the testing]; or
 - (iii) if the applicant is indigent, the testing shall be conducted by the Pennsylvania State Police or, at the Pennsylvania State Police's sole discretion, by a laboratory designated by the Pennsylvania State Police.
 - (2) The costs of any testing ordered under this section shall be paid:
 - (i) by the applicant; or
- 18 (ii) in the case of an applicant who is indigent, by
 19 the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania.
- 20 [Testing conducted by the Pennsylvania State Police (3) 21 shall be carried out in accordance with the protocols and 22 procedures established by the Pennsylvania State Police.] To 23 the extent possible and not inconsistent with best laboratory 24 practices, the testing shall be conducted in a manner that 25 ensures that some portion of the sample is preserved for 26 replication of testing. If the laboratory determines it may 27 be necessary to consume the entirety of any sample during testing, the laboratory shall inform the prosecution, the 28 29 applicant and the applicant's attorney, if applicable, of its 30 recommendation and obtain the prosecution and the applicant's

1 consent before proceeding. If the prosecution and the

2 applicant do not consent, the court may issue any appropriate

3 order before testing proceeds.

(4) If testing is performed by a private laboratory and a DNA database search is anticipated, the applicant shall ensure that the chosen laboratory is accredited and compliant with Federal Bureau of Investigation quality assurance

standards.

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

- (5) When testing is performed by a private laboratory, the Commonwealth shall take all reasonable measures before the testing is conducted to ensure that the results of the testing may be entered into CODIS so that a comparison to known offender or crime scene profiles may be made if the laboratory and test results otherwise satisfy the criteria for database entry.
- (6) Testing conducted by the Pennsylvania State Police shall be carried out in accordance with the protocols and procedures established by the Pennsylvania State Police.
- 19 (f) Posttesting procedures.--
- (1) After the DNA testing conducted under this section
 has been completed, the applicant may, pursuant to section
 9545(b)(2) (relating to jurisdiction and proceedings), during
 the 60-day period beginning on the date on which the
 applicant is notified of the test results, petition to the
 court for postconviction relief pursuant to section 9543(a)
 (2)(vi) (relating to eligibility for relief).
- (2) Upon receipt of a petition filed under paragraph
 (1), the court shall consider the petition along with any
 answer filed by the Commonwealth and shall conduct a hearing
 thereon.

1 In any hearing on a petition for postconviction 2 relief filed under paragraph (1), the court shall determine 3 whether the exculpatory evidence resulting from the DNA testing conducted under this section would have changed the 4 5 outcome of the trial as required by section 9543(a)(2)(vi) 6 (4) If testing complies with Federal Bureau of Investigation requirements and the data meets NDIS criteria, 7 8 profiles obtained from the testing shall be searched or 9 uploaded to CODIS. 10 (5) When testing is conducted by a private laboratory, a court may order a public laboratory with access to CODIS to 11 12 take the necessary measures to ensure the DNA profile 13 obtained from probative biological material from crime scene 14 evidence can be uploaded to CODIS by the public laboratory. Necessary measures may include requiring the public 15 laboratory to conduct a review of the private laboratory's 16 17 facilities or records to ensure that the private laboratory 18 complies with Federal Bureau of Investigation requirements 19 regarding CODIS. If the private laboratory meets Federal 20 Bureau of Investigation and CODIS requirements, the court may 21 order the public laboratory to upload the DNA profile to 22 determine whether the profile matches a profile of a known 23 individual or a profile from an unsolved crime. The DNA 24 profile submitted to the databases must comply with the 25 Federal Bureau of Investigation requirements for the 26 uploading of DNA profiles to CODIS and the Commonwealth shall 27 take all reasonable measures to ensure that the testing 28 complies with the requirements. 29 (6) If DNA testing conclusively identifies the DNA

30

profile of the applicant on probative and inculpatory

- 1 <u>evidence</u>, the court shall dismiss the petition and may make
- 2 any further orders that are appropriate. An order under this
- 3 paragraph may:
- 4 <u>(i) direct that the Pennsylvania Board of Probation</u>
- 5 and Parole be notified of the test results; or
- 6 (ii) mandate that the applicant's DNA profile be
- 7 <u>added to the Commonwealth's convicted offender database.</u>
- 8 (g) Effect of motion. -- The filing of a motion for forensic
- 9 DNA testing pursuant to subsection (a) shall have the following
- 10 effect:
- 11 (1) The filing of the motion shall constitute the
- 12 applicant's consent to provide samples of bodily fluid for
- use in the DNA testing.
- 14 (2) The data from any DNA samples or test results
- obtained as a result of the motion may be entered into law
- enforcement databases, may be used in the investigation of
- other crimes and may be used as evidence against the
- 18 applicant in other cases.
- 19 (h) Definitions.--As used in this section, the following
- 20 words and phrases shall have the meanings given to them in this
- 21 subsection:
- 22 "Applicant." The individual who files a motion under
- 23 subsection (a).
- 24 "CODIS." The Combined DNA Index System administered by the
- 25 Federal Bureau of Investigation that allows for the storage and
- 26 exchange of DNA records submitted by Federal, State and local
- 27 forensic DNA laboratories.
- 28 "DNA." Deoxyribonucleic acid.
- 29 "NDIS." The National DNA Index System which is the national
- 30 DNA database system of DNA records and meets Federal quality

- 1 <u>assurance and privacy standards.</u>
- 2 "Public laboratory." The Pennsylvania State Police DNA
- 3 <u>Laboratory, the Philadelphia Police Department Office of</u>
- 4 Forensic Sciences DNA Laboratory, the Allegheny County DNA
- 5 <u>Laboratory or any other laboratory maintained by the</u>
- 6 <u>Commonwealth with access to CODIS.</u>
- 7 Section 2. This act shall take effect in 60 days.