## THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY OF PENNSYLVANIA

## SENATE BILL

No. 916

Session of 2018

INTRODUCED BY GREENLEAF, BARTOLOTTA, RESCHENTHALER, YUDICHAK, FARNESE, HAYWOOD, VOGEL, BREWSTER, SCARNATI, WHITE, BROWNE, FONTANA, WARD, BOSCOLA AND LEACH, MARCH 15, 2018

REFERRED TO JUDICIARY, MARCH 15, 2018

## AN ACT

- Amending Title 42 (Judiciary and Judicial Procedure) of the 1 Pennsylvania Consolidated Statutes, in post-trial matters, 2 further providing for postconviction DNA testing. 3 4 The General Assembly finds and declares as follows: Postconviction DNA testing has exonerated wrongfully convicted individuals and identified real perpetrators of 7 crimes. To the extent possible, DNA testing of evidence 8 9 before trial is encouraged to help prevent wrongful convictions and to lead to earlier detection and conviction 10 11 of actual perpetrators.
- 12 The General Assembly of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania
- 13 hereby enacts as follows:
- 14 Section 1. Section 9543.1 of Title 42 of the Pennsylvania
- 15 Consolidated Statutes is amended to read:
- 16 § 9543.1. Postconviction DNA testing.
- 17 (a) Motion.--
- 18 (1) An individual convicted of a criminal offense in a

- court of this Commonwealth [and serving a term of imprisonment or awaiting execution because of a sentence of death] may apply by making a written motion to the sentencing court at any time for the performance of forensic DNA testing on specific evidence that is related to the investigation or prosecution that resulted in the judgment of conviction.
  - (2) The evidence may have been discovered either prior to or after the applicant's conviction. The evidence shall be available for testing as of the date of the motion. If the evidence was discovered prior to the applicant's conviction, the evidence shall not have been subject to the DNA testing requested because the technology for testing was not in existence at the time of the trial or the applicant's counsel did not seek testing at the time of the trial in a case where a verdict was rendered on or before January 1, 1995, or the evidence was subject to the testing, but newer technology could provide substantially more accurate and substantially probative results, or the applicant's counsel sought funds from the court to pay for the testing because his client was indigent and the court refused the request despite the client's indigency.
  - (3) A request for DNA testing under this section shall be by written petition and shall be filed with the clerk of courts of the judicial district where the sentence is imposed.
  - (4) DNA testing may be sought at any time if the motion is made in a timely manner and for the purpose of demonstrating the applicant's actual innocence and not to delay the execution of sentence or administration of justice.
- (5) Notwithstanding any other provision of law, a plea

4	_					_			1 ( 1		
1	ΟĪ	quilty	7 to	а	crime	ΟĪ	violence,	as	defined	ın	section

- 2 9714(q) (relating to sentences for second and subsequent
- offenses), or a confession given by an applicant concerning
- 4 the offense for which the applicant was convicted, shall not
- 5 prohibit the applicant from asserting actual innocence under
- 6 <u>subsection (c)(2) or the court from making a determination</u>
- 7 and ordering DNA testing under subsection (d)(2).
- 8 (6) The motion shall explain how, after review of the
- 9 <u>record of the applicant's trial, there is a reasonable</u>
- 10 possibility if the applicant is under State supervision, or
- 11 there is a reasonable probability if the applicant is not
- 12 <u>under State supervision, or after review of the record of the</u>
- 13 <u>applicant's guilty plea there is a reasonable probability</u>,
- 14 that the testing would produce exculpatory evidence that
- would establish:
- (i) the applicant's actual innocence of the offense
- for which the applicant was convicted;
- 18 (ii) in a capital case, the applicant's actual
- innocence of the charged or uncharged conduct
- 20 constituting an aggravating circumstance under section
- 21 <u>9711(d) (relating to sentencing procedure for murder of</u>
- 22 the first degree) if the applicant's exoneration of the
- 23 <u>conduct would result in vacating a sentence of death; or</u>
- 24 (iii) in a capital case, a mitigating circumstance
- 25 under section 9711(e)(7) under the circumstances set
- 26 forth in section 9711(c)(1)(iv).
- 27 (b) Notice to the Commonwealth.--
- 28 (1) Upon receipt of a motion under subsection (a), the
- court shall notify the Commonwealth and shall afford the
- 30 Commonwealth an opportunity to respond to the motion.

- 1 (2) Upon receipt of a motion under subsection (a) or 2 notice of the motion, as applicable, the Commonwealth and the 3 court shall take the steps reasonably necessary to ensure 4 that any remaining biological material in the possession of 5 the Commonwealth or the court is preserved pending the
- 7 (c) Requirements.--In any motion under subsection (a), under 8 penalty of perjury, the applicant shall:
  - (1) (i) specify the evidence to be tested;

completion of the proceedings under this section.

- (ii) state that the applicant consents to provide samples of bodily fluid for use in the DNA testing; and
  - (iii) acknowledge that the applicant understands that, if the motion is granted, any data obtained from any DNA samples or test results may be entered into law enforcement databases, may be used in the investigation of other crimes and may be used as evidence against the applicant in other cases.
  - (2) (i) in a sworn statement subject to the penalties under 18 Pa.C.S. §§ 4902 (relating to perjury) and 4903 (relating to false swearing), assert the applicant's actual innocence of the offense for which the applicant was convicted and that the applicant seeks DNA testing for the purpose of demonstrating the applicant's actual innocence; and
    - (ii) in a capital case:
    - (A) assert the applicant's actual innocence of
      the charged or uncharged conduct constituting an
      aggravating circumstance under section 9711(d)
      [(relating to sentencing procedure for murder of the
      first degree)] if the applicant's exoneration of the

1 conduct would result in vacating a sentence of death; 2 or 3 assert that the outcome of the DNA testing would establish a mitigating circumstance under 4 section 9711(e)(7) if that mitigating circumstance 5 6 was presented to the sentencing judge or jury and 7 facts as to that issue were in dispute at the 8 sentencing hearing. 9 (3) present a prima facie case demonstrating that the: 10 identity of or the participation in the crime by the perpetrator was at issue in the proceedings that 11 12 resulted in the applicant's conviction and sentencing; 13 and 14 (ii) DNA testing of the specific evidence, assuming exculpatory results, would establish: 15 16 the applicant's actual innocence of the offense for which the applicant was convicted; 17 18 in a capital case, the applicant's actual 19 innocence of the charged or uncharged conduct 20 constituting an aggravating circumstance under 21 section 9711(d) if the applicant's exoneration of the 22 conduct would result in vacating a sentence of death; 23 or 24 in a capital case, a mitigating circumstance 25 under section 9711(e)(7) under the circumstances set 26 forth in [subsection (c)(1)(iv)] section 9711(c)(1) 27 (iv). 28 (d) Order.--29 Except as provided in paragraph (2), the court shall order the testing requested in a motion under subsection (a) 30

under reasonable conditions designed to preserve the integrity of the evidence and the testing process upon a determination, after review of the record of the applicant's

trial, that the:

- (i) requirements of subsection (c) have been met;
- (ii) evidence to be tested has been subject to a chain of custody sufficient to establish that it has not been altered in any material respect; and
- (iii) motion is made in a timely manner and for the purpose of demonstrating the applicant's actual innocence and not to delay the execution of sentence or administration of justice.
- (2) The court shall not order the testing requested in a motion under subsection (a) if, after review of the record of the applicant's trial, the court determines that there is no reasonable possibility for an applicant under State supervision, or there is no reasonable probability for an applicant not under State supervision, or after review of the record of the applicant's guilty plea, the court determines that there is no reasonable probability, that the testing would produce exculpatory evidence that:
  - (i) would establish the applicant's actual innocence of the offense for which the applicant was convicted;
  - (ii) in a capital case, would establish the applicant's actual innocence of the charged or uncharged conduct constituting an aggravating circumstance under section 9711(d) if the applicant's exoneration of the conduct would result in vacating a sentence of death; or
- (iii) in a capital case, would establish a mitigating circumstance under section 9711(e)(7) under

1	the circumstances set forth in [subsection (c)(1)(iv)]
2	<u>section 9711(c)(1)(iv)</u> .
3	(3) Any DNA testing order under this section shall
4	constitute a final order. An applicant or the Commonwealth
5	may appeal a decision denying or granting a DNA testing order
6	in accordance with the Pennsylvania Rules of Appellate
7	Procedure.
8	(4) Any decision granting or denying a DNA testing order
9	shall include an explanation by the court of how the testing
10	requested in a motion under subsection (a) has met or fails
11	to have met the requirements under paragraphs (1), (2) and
12	<u>(3).</u>
13	(5) Upon determining the petitioner has met the
14	applicable burden established in paragraph (1) or (2), the
15	court may require the Commonwealth to prepare an inventory of
16	evidence related to the case and serve a copy of the
17	inventory to the prosecution, the applicant, the applicant's
18	attorney, if applicable, and the court. The inventory may
19	include, but not be limited to, a list of evidence collected
20	and forensic testing previously done relating to the evidence
21	and the names of agencies that conducted the forensic
22	testing.
23	(e) Testing procedures
24	(1) Any DNA testing ordered under this section shall be
25	conducted by:
26	(i) a laboratory mutually selected by the
27	Commonwealth and the applicant;
28	(ii) <u>a laboratory selected by the court that ordered</u>
29	the testing if the Commonwealth and the applicant are
30	unable to agree on a laboratory[, a laboratory selected

1 by the court that ordered the testing]; or

2 if the applicant is indigent, the testing 3 shall be conducted by the Pennsylvania State Police or, at the Pennsylvania State Police's sole discretion, by a 4

The costs of any testing ordered under this section (2) shall be paid:

laboratory designated by the Pennsylvania State Police.

- (i) by the applicant; or
- 9 in the case of an applicant who is indigent, by the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania. 10
  - (3) [Testing conducted by the Pennsylvania State Police shall be carried out in accordance with the protocols and procedures established by the Pennsylvania State Police.] To the extent possible and not inconsistent with best laboratory practices, the testing shall be conducted in a manner that ensures that some portion of the sample is preserved for replication of testing. If the laboratory determines it may be necessary to consume the entirety of any sample during testing, the laboratory shall inform the prosecution, the applicant and the applicant's attorney, if applicable, of its recommendation and obtain the prosecution and the applicant's consent before proceeding. If the prosecution and the applicant do not consent, the court may issue any appropriate order before testing proceeds.
    - (4) If testing is performed by a private laboratory and a DNA database search is anticipated, the applicant shall ensure that the chosen laboratory is accredited by an accreditation body that is a signatory to the International Laboratory Accreditation Cooperation Mutual Recognition Agreement that is designated by the Federal Bureau of

5

6

7

8

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

- 1 Investigation in accordance with 34 U.S.C. § 12591 (relating
- 2 to quality assurance and proficiency testing standards), that
- 3 requires conformance to forensic science requirements and
- 4 that the accreditation include DNA testing, and is compliant
- 5 <u>with Federal Bureau of Investigation quality assurance</u>
- 6 <u>standards.</u>
- 7 (5) When testing is performed by a private laboratory,
- 8 <u>the public laboratory shall take all reasonable measures</u>
- 9 <u>before the testing is conducted to ensure that the results of</u>
- the testing may be entered into CODIS so that a comparison to
- known offender or crime scene profiles may be made if the
- 12 <u>laboratory and test results otherwise satisfy the criteria</u>
- for database entry.
- 14 (6) Testing conducted by the Pennsylvania State Police
- shall be carried out in accordance with the protocols and
- 16 <u>procedures established by the Pennsylvania State Police.</u>
- 17 (7) To the extent possible, if communication with the
- parties regarding the testing process and test results is
- 19 necessary, the testing laboratory shall communicate with
- 20 counsel for petitioner and the Commonwealth simultaneously.
- 21 (8) No direct communication involving the testing
- 22 laboratory without the inclusion of a representative of each
- 23 party shall occur.
- 24 (f) Posttesting procedures.--
- 25 (1) After the DNA testing conducted under this section
- has been completed, the applicant may, pursuant to section
- 27 9545(b)(2) (relating to jurisdiction and proceedings), during
- the [60-day] one-year period beginning on the date on which
- 29 the applicant is notified of the test results, petition to
- 30 the court for postconviction relief pursuant to section

- 1 9543(a)(2)(vi) (relating to eligibility for relief).
- 2 (2) Upon receipt of a petition filed under paragraph
- 3 (1), the court shall consider the petition along with any
- 4 answer filed by the Commonwealth and shall conduct a hearing
- 5 thereon.
- 6 (3) In any hearing on a petition for postconviction
- 7 relief filed under paragraph (1), the court shall determine
- 8 whether the exculpatory evidence resulting from the DNA
- 9 testing conducted under this section would have changed the
- outcome of the trial as required by section 9543(a)(2)(vi).
- 11 (4) If testing complies with Federal Bureau of
- 12 <u>Investigation requirements and the data meets NDIS criteria,</u>
- 13 <u>profiles obtained from the testing shall be searched or</u>
- 14 <u>uploaded to CODIS.</u>
- (5) When testing is conducted by a private laboratory, a
- court may order a public laboratory with access to CODIS to
- take the necessary measures to ensure the DNA profile
- 18 obtained from probative biological material from crime scene
- evidence can be uploaded to CODIS by the public laboratory.
- Necessary measures may include requiring the public
- 21 laboratory to conduct a review of the private laboratory's
- facilities or records to ensure that the private laboratory
- 23 complies with Federal Bureau of Investigation requirements
- regarding CODIS. If the private laboratory meets Federal
- 25 Bureau of Investigation and CODIS requirements, the court may
- order the public laboratory to upload the DNA profile to
- determine whether the profile matches a profile of a known
- individual or a profile from an unsolved crime. The DNA
- 29 <u>profile submitted to the databases must comply with the</u>
- 30 <u>Federal Bureau of Investigation requirements for the</u>

- 1 <u>uploading of DNA profiles to CODIS, and the Commonwealth</u>
- 2 <u>shall take all reasonable measures to ensure that the testing</u>
- 3 complies with the requirements.
- 4 (6) If DNA testing conclusively identifies the DNA
- 5 profile of the applicant on probative and inculpatory
- 6 evidence, the court shall dismiss the petition and may make
- 7 any further orders that are appropriate. An order under this
- 8 <u>paragraph may:</u>
- 9 (i) direct that the Pennsylvania Board of Probation
- and Parole be notified of the test results; or
- 11 (ii) mandate that the applicant's DNA profile be
- 12 added to the Commonwealth's convicted offender database.
- 13 (g) Effect of motion. -- The filing of a motion for forensic
- 14 DNA testing pursuant to subsection (a) shall have the following
- 15 effect:
- 16 (1) The filing of the motion shall constitute the
- 17 applicant's consent to provide samples of bodily fluid for
- 18 use in the DNA testing.
- 19 (2) The data from any DNA samples or test results
- obtained as a result of the motion may be entered into law
- 21 enforcement databases, may be used in the investigation of
- other crimes and may be used as evidence against the
- 23 applicant in other cases.
- 24 (h) Definitions.--As used in this section, the following
- 25 words and phrases shall have the meanings given to them in this
- 26 subsection:
- 27 "Applicant." The individual who files a motion under
- 28 subsection (a).
- 29 "CODIS." The Combined DNA Index System administered by the
- 30 Federal Bureau of Investigation that allows for the storage and

- 1 <u>exchange of DNA records submitted by Federal, State and local</u>
- 2 forensic DNA laboratories.
- 3 "DNA." Deoxyribonucleic acid.
- 4 "NDIS." The National DNA Index System which is the national
- 5 DNA database system of DNA records and meets Federal quality
- 6 <u>assurance and privacy standards.</u>
- 7 <u>"Public laboratory." The Pennsylvania State Police Forensic</u>
- 8 DNA Division, the Philadelphia Police Department Forensic
- 9 <u>Science Bureau</u>, the Allegheny County Medical Examiner's Office
- 10 or any other laboratory maintained by the Commonwealth with
- 11 <u>access to CODIS.</u>
- 12 Section 2. This act shall take effect in 60 days.