THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY OF PENNSYLVANIA

HOUSE BILL

No. 166

Session of 1977

INTRODUCED BY MESSRS. FREIND, ZEARFOSS, SPITZ, BURD, LYNCH,
W. D. HUTCHINSON AND DAVIES, FEBRUARY 8, 1977

REFERRED TO COMMITTEE ON JUDICIARY, FEBRUARY 8, 1977

1

AN ACT

Creating the Pennsylvania State Commission of Investigation to

2 replace the Pennsylvania Crime Commission, prescribing the 3 procedure for the exercise of its powers and duties, and providing for the protection of the rights of those involved 5 in its operation. 6 TABLE OF CONTENTS Section 1. Statement of purpose. Section 2. Pennsylvania State Commission of Investigation. 9 Section 3. Minority commissioners. Section 4. 10 Senate confirmation required. 11 Section 5. Removal of commissioners for cause. 12 Section 6. Ban on partisan activities by commissioners and employees; civil service. 13 14 Section 7. Executive director. Commission staff; expenses. 15 Section 8. Section 9. Notice of meetings. 16 17 Section 10. Scheduling and conduct of hearings and 18 investigations. 19 Section 11. Resolutions scheduling hearings or ordering

- 1 investigations.
- 2 Section 12. Liaison with other law enforcement agencies.
- 3 Section 13. Issuance of reports.
- 4 Section 14. Release of testimony taken in executive session.
- 5 Section 15. Right to counsel.
- 6 Section 16. Testimony; rulings on motions and objections.
- 7 Section 17. Notice to witnesses of subject matter.
- 8 Section 18. Claims of privilege.
- 9 Section 19. Right to make complete answers and submit
- 10 written statement.
- 11 Section 20. Availability of transcripts of hearings.
- 12 Section 21. Review of evidence and testimony adversely
- 13 affecting a party.
- 14 Section 22. Right to appear of adversely affected party.
- 15 Section 23. Contents of reports recommending indictments.
- 16 Section 24. Subpoenas.
- 17 Section 25. Conduct of communications media.
- 18 Section 26. Appeals.
- 19 Section 27. Open meetings; quorums; votes; minutes.
- 20 Section 28. Presiding officer.
- 21 Section 29. References in other laws.
- 22 Section 30. Severability.
- 23 Section 31. Repealer.
- 24 Section 32. Effective date.
- 25 The General Assembly of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania
- 26 hereby enacts as follows:
- 27 Section 1. Statement of purpose.
- 28 The General Assembly recognizing the potential for abuse of
- 29 individual rights by law enforcement agencies not subject to
- 30 statutory controls, herein establishes an investigative

- 1 commission and sets standards to protect the rights of witnesses
- 2 before and of others adversely affected by evidence presented to
- 3 that commission. It seeks to protect the ability of that
- 4 commission to perform expeditiously its powers and duties. This
- 5 act is also intended to remove members of the commission from
- 6 partisan political control and protect them from excessive
- 7 gubernatorial control.
- 8 Section 2. Pennsylvania State Commission of Investigation.
- 9 (a) The Pennsylvania State Commission of Investigation is
- 10 hereby created. All of the powers and duties of the Pennsylvania
- 11 Crime Commission are hereby transferred to the Pennsylvania
- 12 State Commission of Investigation. It shall consist of four
- 13 commissioners appointed by the Governor, pursuant to the terms
- 14 of this act, and the Attorney General. The chairman shall be
- 15 elected by majority vote of the members of the commission.
- 16 (b) The commissioners, other than the Attorney General, whom
- 17 the Governor shall appoint to fill the terms which will expire
- 18 on July 1 next following the effective date of this act shall
- 19 serve for terms of six years. The commissioners whom the
- 20 Governor shall appoint to fill the terms which will expire on
- 21 the second July 1 following the effective date of this act shall
- 22 serve for terms of two years. The commissioners whom the
- 23 Governor shall appoint to fill the terms which will expire on
- 24 the fourth July 1 following the effective date of this act shall
- 25 serve for terms of six years. Thereafter, all commissioners,
- 26 other than the Attorney General, shall serve for terms of six
- 27 years except those appointed to fill the balance of an unexpired
- 28 term who shall serve only for the balance of such term.
- 29 (c) Each commissioner may be appointed for more than one
- 30 term.

- 1 (d) Commissioners shall receive \$50 per day as compensation
- 2 for their services.
- 3 Section 3. Minority commissioners.
- 4 Whenever vacancies shall occur on the commission, whether
- 5 through expiration of a term or otherwise, the Governor shall
- 6 appoint commissioners so as to insure that two of the appointed
- 7 members be of different political parties from the other two
- 8 appointed members. Whenever two of the appointed members are of
- 9 different political parties from the other two appointed
- 10 members, all subsequent appointments shall be made by the
- 11 Governor so as to insure that the commission shall continue to
- 12 have two appointed members of different political parties from
- 13 the other two appointed members.
- 14 Section 4. Senate confirmation required.
- 15 All appointments by the Governor to the commission shall be
- 16 subject to the consent of a majority of the Senate, according to
- 17 the provisions of section 8, Article IV of the Constitution of
- 18 Pennsylvania.
- 19 Section 5. Removal of commissioners for cause.
- 20 (a) A commissioner shall be removed by the Governor only for
- 21 malfeasance or misfeasance in office, neglect of duty, or
- 22 physical or mental incapacity, or upon indictment or any
- 23 substituted procedure for any felony or conviction of any
- 24 misdemeanor against the United States, this or any other state.
- 25 (b) A commissioner so removed may petition the Commonwealth
- 26 Court for reinstatement within ten days of his removal. The
- 27 court shall hold an expedited hearing and render a decision
- 28 thereon within 30 days. There shall be no appeal from the
- 29 decision of the Commonwealth Court.
- 30 (c) Any citizen of this Commonwealth may petition the

- 1 Commonwealth Court to remove a commissioner upon indictment or
- 2 any other procedure for a felony or upon conviction of a
- 3 misdemeanor against the United States, this or any other state.
- 4 Section 6. Ban or partisan activities by commissioners and
- 5 employees; civil service.
- 6 (a) A commissioner, other than the Attorney General, and an
- 7 employee of the commission, shall not engage in any partisan
- 8 activity, other than voting and making but not soliciting
- 9 contributions to candidates for office. A violation of this
- 10 subsection shall be deemed "misfeasance in office" under section
- 11 5.
- 12 (b) Commission employees, other than attorneys and
- 13 investigators, shall be hired and promoted and shall retain
- 14 their employment subject to the provisions of the act of August
- 15 5, 1941 (P.L.752, No.286), known as the "Civil Service Act."
- 16 Section 7. Executive director.
- 17 (a) The commission shall appoint an executive director,
- 18 subject to the approval of a majority of the Senate, who shall
- 19 serve at the pleasure of the commission.
- 20 (b) The executive director shall be a full-time employee of
- 21 the commission and shall retain no outside assistance. His
- 22 salary shall be fixed at \$30,000, unless changed by the
- 23 commission. It shall not be diminished during his tenure.
- 24 Section 8. Commission staff; expenses.
- 25 (a) The executive director shall appoint, employ and promote
- 26 such personnel as he deems necessary to carry out the duties of
- 27 the commission, subject to the limitations of section 6(b).
- 28 Salaries of such personnel shall be fixed by the commission.
- 29 (b) Subject to the limitations of section 6(b), the
- 30 appointment of any such personnel shall require the approval of

- 1 a majority vote at a meeting at which a majority of the
- 2 commissioners is actually present, upon motion of any
- 3 commissioner timely filed under rules which the commission shall
- 4 promulgate.
- 5 (c) Expenses incurred by commissioners or employees of the
- 6 commission shall be allowed and paid upon the presentation of
- 7 itemized vouchers therefor and approval by the commission, in
- 8 the same manner and procedure as set forth for employees of the
- 9 Department of Justice.
- 10 Section 9. Notice of meetings.
- 11 All meetings of the commission shall be called only upon a
- 12 minimum of 72 hours notice to the office of each commissioner,
- 13 although this provision may be waived by the assent of a
- 14 majority of the commissioners after reasonable notice to all
- 15 commissioners.
- 16 Section 10. Scheduling and conduct of hearings and
- investigations.
- 18 (a) Commission hearings, in public or executive session, and
- 19 all commission investigations, shall be scheduled and conducted
- 20 only upon a majority vote at a meeting at which a majority of
- 21 the commissioners is actually present.
- 22 (b) Testimony may be given and evidence taken at a meeting
- 23 at which less than a majority, but at least one, of the
- 24 commissioners is actually present.
- 25 (c) A member of the commission who is absent from a hearing
- 26 shall be given full access to a transcript thereof or, if no
- 27 transcript is made, a report of the information received
- 28 therein, prior to the making by the commission of any finding,
- 29 recommendation or report based in any part upon information
- 30 received in such hearing.

- 1 Section 11. Resolutions scheduling hearings or ordering
- 2 investigations.
- 3 A resolution scheduling hearings or ordering investigations
- 4 shall state clearly and with particularity the subject thereof
- 5 and the county or counties, agency or agencies, or individual or
- 6 individuals concerned with the subject, which resolution may be
- 7 amended by a majority vote at a meeting at which a majority of
- 8 the commissioners is actually present.
- 9 Section 12. Liaison with other law enforcement agencies.
- 10 (a) A commissioner of the executive director shall consult
- 11 with the district attorney or president judge in the county or
- 12 counties set forth in any resolution adopted pursuant to section
- 13 11 hereof to prevent any interference with any confidential
- 14 investigation already undertaken. He shall also consult with the
- 15 United States Attorney for the district or districts in which
- 16 such investigation is to be undertaken and with the Commissioner
- 17 of the State Police, or the Attorney General or the Governor of
- 18 the Commonwealth for the same purpose. The results of the
- 19 consultation shall be reported to the commission before any
- 20 interviews are conducted in connection with the investigation or
- 21 any witnesses called to testify therein.
- 22 (b) The provisions of this section may be waived as to any
- 23 or all of the officials named in the preceding subsection by a
- 24 majority vote at a meeting at which a majority of the
- 25 commissioners is actually present.
- 26 Section 13. Issuance of reports.
- 27 No commission report shall be issued unless a draft of such
- 28 report is submitted to the office of each commissioner at least
- 29 two weeks in advance of the meeting at which it is to be
- 30 considered and unless the report is adopted by a majority vote

- 1 at a meeting at which a majority of the commissioners is
- 2 actually present.
- 3 Section 14. Release of testimony taken in executive session.
- 4 (a) No testimony taken in executive session, any part
- 5 thereof, or any summary thereof shall be released or disclosed
- 6 to any person either orally or in writing by any member or
- 7 employee of the commission without the authorization of the
- 8 commission by a majority vote at a meeting at which a majority
- 9 of the commissioners is actually present.
- 10 (b) A violation of subsection (a) by any employee of the
- 11 commission, shall, upon motion of any commissioner and the
- 12 affirmative vote of at least four commissioners at a meeting at
- 13 which said four commissioners are actually present, result in
- 14 the dismissal of such employee and his permanent
- 15 disqualification from future employment by the commission. The
- 16 employee shall first be granted a hearing, with at least 30 days
- 17 notice, at which he may dispute the allegations personally or
- 18 through counsel of his own choosing. A commissioner who has not
- 19 attended the hearing in person shall not be eligible to vote for
- 20 the removal of the employee. The burden of proving such
- 21 violation by clear and convincing proof shall be on the
- 22 commission. The employee may appeal his dismissal to the
- 23 Commonwealth Court, within ten days thereof. The only basis for
- 24 a reversal of the dismissal shall be abuse of discretion by the
- 25 commission.
- 26 (c) A violation of subsection (a) by a commissioner, shall
- 27 be grounds for removal of him under section 5.
- 28 (d) A provision of this section shall not work to abrogate
- 29 or limit any right extended by the act of June 25, 1937
- 30 (P.L.2123, No.433), relating to confidential communications to

- 1 news reporters.
- 2 Section 15. Right to counsel.
- 3 (a) Witnesses at commission hearings, in public or executive
- 4 session, shall have the right to be accompanied by counsel of
- 5 their own choosing who shall have the right to advise the
- 6 witness of his rights and to make brief objections to the
- 7 procedures and to the relevancy of the questions.
- 8 (b) A witness refusing to answer a question on the grounds
- 9 of relevancy may raise the issue of relevancy as a defense in
- 10 any prosecution for contempt of the commission. The burden of
- 11 proving irrelevancy by the witness shall be by clear and
- 12 convincing proof.
- 13 Section 16. Testimony; rulings on motions and objections.
- 14 (a) The testimony on matters of fact received at hearings
- 15 shall be under oath or affirmation. The presiding officer may
- 16 receive any evidence, by testimony, deposition, exhibit or
- 17 otherwise, which he deems relevant.
- 18 (b) Rulings on motions and objections shall be made by the
- 19 commission member presiding, subject to appeal to the members
- 20 present on motion of a member.
- 21 Section 17. Notice to witnesses of subject matter.
- 22 At least 24 hours prior to the scheduled time for his
- 23 testimony, a witness shall be given a copy of that portion of
- 24 the resolution scheduling the hearing and stating the subject
- 25 matter thereof, as well as a copy of any and all statutes or
- 26 rules governing the conduct of the commission. A witness shall
- 27 be entitled only to that portion of said resolution relevant to
- 28 his testimony and shall not be entitled to examine testimony and
- 29 evidence previously taken by the commission, except for such
- 30 testimony and evidence as has already been made public by order

- 1 of the commission.
- 2 Section 18. Claims of privilege.
- 3 (a) The commission shall respect all testimonial privileges
- 4 granted by law.
- 5 (b) A witness refusing to answer a question on the grounds
- 6 of privilege may raise the issue of privilege as a defense in
- 7 any prosecution for contempt of the commission. Whenever
- 8 evidence of such privilege is introduced, the burden shall be on
- 9 the commission to disprove such privilege by a preponderance of
- 10 the evidence, unless a greater burden or different procedure is
- 11 constitutionally required.
- 12 Section 19. Right to make complete answers and submit written
- 13 statement.
- 14 (a) A witness shall have the right to make complete answers
- 15 to questions and explanations of such answers, subject to
- 16 termination for irrelevancy or unnecessary length.
- 17 (b) A witness shall have the right to file a sworn written
- 18 statement, which shall be a part of the transcript of the
- 19 hearing, provided it is relevant and free of scandalous or
- 20 impertinent material. A witness at a public hearing shall be
- 21 given ten minutes before questioning to read such a statement or
- 22 part thereof, provided the statement is submitted to the
- 23 commission at least 24 hours in advance of the hearing.
- 24 Section 20. Availability of transcripts of hearings.
- 25 (a) A stenographic verbatim transcript shall be made of all
- 26 commission hearings, in public or executive session.
- 27 (b) A copy of all transcripts of public hearings shall be
- 28 available to the public for inspection in the commission office
- 29 during regular business hours and for purchase at regularly
- 30 prescribed rates from the official reporter.

- 1 (c) A witness and his counsel shall have the right to
- 2 inspect only the complete transcript of his own testimony taken
- 3 in executive session in the commission office during regular
- 4 business hours.
- 5 Section 21. Review of evidence and testimony adversely
- 6 affecting a party.
- 7 All material reflecting adversely on the character or
- 8 reputation of an individual shall be reviewed in executive
- 9 session to determine its relevance, reliability and probative
- 10 value before being presented in public session. The commission
- 11 may, based on staff report, waive this section by a majority
- 12 vote at a meeting at which a majority of the commissioners is
- 13 actually present.
- 14 Section 22. Right to appear of adversely affected party.
- 15 (a) If a person is adversely affected by evidence or
- 16 testimony given in a public hearing, that person shall have the
- 17 right, upon the filing of an application within 30 days after
- 18 the introduction of such evidence or the termination of adverse
- 19 testimony, to have the commission convene a hearing within 30
- 20 days of his application. He shall have the right at such
- 21 hearing:
- 22 (1) To be represented by counsel at his own choosing.
- 23 (2) To file a sworn written statement, which shall be a
- 24 part of the transcript of the hearing provided it is relevant
- and free of scandalous or impertinent material.
- 26 (3) To read the statement before any questioning,
- 27 subject to termination after 20 minutes, provided such
- 28 statement is submitted to the commission at least 24 hours in
- 29 advance of the hearing.
- 30 (b) A person exercising a privilege of reply under this

- 1 section shall be subject to questioning at the hearing so
- 2 convened, as if he had been validly subpoenaed by the
- 3 commission.
- 4 (c) A party aggrieved by the provisions of this section may
- 5 appeal to Commonwealth Court.
- 6 Section 23. Contents of reports recommending indictments.
- 7 A commission report recommending criminal indictment of or
- 8 information against any person shall include specific references
- 9 to the statutes or common law allegedly violated and set forth
- 10 such details of the alleged offense or offenses as to enable the
- 11 prosecuting authority to provide for the issuance of arrest
- 12 warrants.
- 13 Section 24. Subpoenas.
- 14 (a) Subpoenas shall be issued in the name of the commission
- 15 over the signature of the executive director only upon 72 hours
- 16 written notice to all members of the commission with a statement
- 17 as to the identity of the witness or material and the relevance
- 18 to the investigation or hearing already authorized, and with the
- 19 prior consent of three commissioners. Subpoenas shall be
- 20 notarized and shall not be signed in blank or in advance by the
- 21 executive director. Three commissioners may, by oral
- 22 instructions to the executive director, veto the issuance of a
- 23 subpoena. A subpoena shall not be valid unless issued in
- 24 compliance with this section. Three commissioners may waive the
- 25 72 hours notice by oral instructions to the executive director
- 26 reduced to writing and filed in the office of the commissioner.
- 27 (b) Persons deemed to have information relevant to any
- 28 investigation may be required by subpoena to appear and testify
- 29 at a commission hearing. Persons, corporations, entities or
- 30 associations of any kind having possession or control of

- 1 documents or records deemed relevant to any investigation may be
- 2 required by subpoena to produce such materials at a commission
- 3 hearing or, at the election of the commission, to make them
- 4 available for inspection by one or more members of the
- 5 commission, or one or more members of the staff of the
- 6 commission designated for such purpose by the commission.
- 7 Subpoenas may be served by any person designated by the
- 8 executive director.
- 9 (c) The commission shall have the right to retain or have
- 10 access to subpoenaed documents and records for a reasonable
- 11 period, and to make copies of such documents and records.
- 12 (d) Witnesses subpoenaed by the commission shall be entitled
- 13 to compensation and payment for expenses as the commission shall
- 14 provide by regulation.
- 15 Section 25. Conduct of communications media.
- 16 The commission shall insure that the various equipment,
- 17 devices and instruments of the communications media does not
- 18 needlessly distract, harass or confuse the witness and interfere
- 19 with his presentation. It shall not bar the media from the
- 20 hearing. Upon request of the witness, the commission may bar the
- 21 use of flashcubes during testimony or reading of a written
- 22 statement so long as a reasonable period for use of flashcubes
- 23 is allowed prior to the witness' presentation and after the oath
- 24 has been administered. Nothing in the preceding sentence shall
- 25 be interpreted to bar the use of television cameras or
- 26 television lights during the presentation of the witness.
- 27 Section 26. Appeals.
- 28 Appeals from actions of the commission shall be taken to
- 29 Commonwealth Court within 30 days of the action complained of.
- 30 Section 27. Open meetings; quorums; votes; minutes.

- 1 (a) The commission shall not be deemed an "agency" within
- 2 the meaning of the act of July 19, 1974 (P.L.486, No.175),
- 3 referred to as the Public Agency Open Meeting Law, or the act of
- 4 June 21, 1957 (P.L.390, No.212), referred to as the Right-to-
- 5 Know Law, when it meets or acts other than in public session.
- 6 (b) A majority of the commissioners shall constitute a
- 7 quorum, unless otherwise provided in this act.
- 8 (c) All votes shall be of record but need not be published
- 9 if, in the judgment of the commission, such publication would
- 10 jeopardize a confidential investigation. Unless otherwise
- 11 provided in this act, the commission shall act only upon a
- 12 majority vote at a quorum meeting.
- 13 (d) Minutes of meetings shall be kept by the executive
- 14 director and filed at the executive office of the commission.
- 15 Minutes shall not be open to inspection by persons other than
- 16 members of the commission and its staff, except as otherwise
- 17 authorized by the commission.
- 18 Section 28. Presiding officer.
- 19 (a) The chairman of the commission shall preside over all
- 20 hearings at which he is present. He may designate a member of
- 21 the commission to preside over any hearing at which he will not
- 22 be present. In the absence of such designation, a member shall
- 23 be chosen by the majority vote of the members present and voting
- 24 to preside over such hearing.
- 25 (b) The presiding officer shall administer oaths and
- 26 affirmations to witnesses, rule upon matters arising in the
- 27 course of the hearing, and take necessary actions to insure that
- 28 the hearing proceeds in an orderly and proper manner.
- 29 Section 29. References in other laws.
- Whenever in any law reference is made to the Pennsylvania

- 1 Crime Commission such reference shall be deemed to refer to and
- 2 include the Pennsylvania State Commission of Investigation.
- 3 Section 30. Severability.
- 4 If any provisions of this act or the application thereof to
- 5 any person or circumstance is held invalid, the other provisions
- 6 and their application to other persons and circumstances shall
- 7 not be affected.
- 8 Section 31. Repealer.
- 9 All acts and parts of acts are repealed insofar as they are
- 10 inconsistent herewith.
- 11 Section 32. Effective date.
- 12 This act shall take effect immediately.